

---

## Governance Review – Advisory Committees – Governance Structure

### Recommendation

That the Governance and Priorities Committee recommend to City Council that:

1. The Terms of Reference for the Advisory Committee on Community Wellbeing and Safety; the Advisory Committee on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion; the Saskatoon Environmental Advisory Committee; the Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee; the Public Art Advisory Committee; and, the Saskatoon Accessibility Advisory Committee included at Attachment 2, be approved;
2. The Naming Advisory Committee no longer be classified as an advisory committee and that it be renamed The Civic Naming Committee and revised Terms of Reference and amendments to *Policy No. C09-008, Naming of Civic Property and Development Areas Policy* be made in accordance with the resolution package from the minutes of the Naming Advisory Committee meeting held on March 8, 2018 included at Attachment 4;
3. The Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee amend the appropriate policies as required to reflect the new advisory committee structure and Terms of Reference;
4. The City Solicitor be directed to amend *Bylaw No. 9170, The Procedures and Committees Bylaw, 2014* to reflect the new advisory committee structure;
5. *Policy No. C01-003, Appointments to Civic Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees Policy* be amended to reflect any consequential amendments as a result of the new advisory committee structure and to amend the section related to services provided to members as described in this report;
6. Members of City Council not be appointed to advisory committees;
7. Composition of the Public Art Advisory Committee be increased to include two members of the First Nations or Métis community;
8. Either the advisory committee chair, vice-chair or Council member appointed to an advisory committee act as a mentor to the youth member of the committee;
9. Citizen appointments to advisory committees be made for two year staggered terms with a maximum membership duration of six years; and
10. The Advisory Committee on Community Wellbeing and Safety provide any recommended changes to the Terms of Reference including mandate and composition simultaneous to its annual reporting for 2019.

### Topic and Purpose

This report is the third in a series of reports respecting the Governance Review of the City's advisory committees.

The focus of this report is to begin implementation of Council's direction in respect of the general governance structure of City of Saskatoon advisory committees.

## Strategic Goals

This report supports the Strategic Goals of Continuous Improvement and Quality of Life as it supports City Council in providing good governance to the citizens of Saskatoon.

## Background

At the February 13, 2017 meeting of the Governance and Priorities Committee (“GPC”), the Committee resolved:

“that the project parameters for the review of governance structures, models, practices and procedures of Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Business Improvement Districts and any other agency, board or commission established by the City of Saskatoon be approved.”

In Phase One of the governance review, the Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee (“Governance Subcommittee”) provided recommendations respecting the general governance model for advisory committees. A series of City Council resolutions has followed since initial reporting by the Governance Subcommittee. Attachment 1 contains a summary of the reporting on the advisory committee governance model and the resulting direction of City Council.

This report is intended to commence implementation of the advisory committee structure as directed by City Council and to answer related inquiries.

## Report

Saskatoon City Council has established several advisory committees pursuant to *The Cities Act* and Part V of *Bylaw No. 9170, The Procedures and Committees* (the “Procedures Bylaw”). Currently, there are 10 advisory committees. In accordance with Council’s direction, six advisory committees will remain as at January 1, 2019:

- Reporting to the Standing Policy Committee on Planning, Development and Community Services (SPC-PDCS)
  - Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee (MHAC); and
  - Advisory Committee on Community Wellbeing & Safety (CWSC)
- Reporting to the Standing Policy Committee on Finance (SPC-FIN)
  - Public Art Advisory Committee (PAAC)
- Reporting to the Standing Policy Committee on Environment, Utilities and Corporate Services (SPC-EUCS)
  - Saskatoon Environmental Advisory Committee (SEAC); and
  - Advisory Committee on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion (DEIC)
- Reporting to the Standing Policy Committee on Transportation
  - Saskatoon Accessibility Advisory Committee (SAAC)

The Procedures Bylaw requires amendment to reflect this new structure.

## Terms of Reference

As part of the governance review, the Governance Subcommittee examined and amended existing Terms of Reference and drafted new Terms of Reference for the

reimagined advisory committees. Consideration was given to all aspects of the Terms of Reference, including mandate, composition, membership qualifications, term of appointment and reporting.

This report is recommending some variation to the membership of existing committees as identified in the draft Terms of Reference. Common to all of the advisory committees, however, is the membership inclusion of a representative from the youth community. A member of the LGBTQ2S community has been added to a couple of the committees. In addition, all representatives from the Administration are now identified as non-voting resource members. It is proposed that the appointment of resource staff would be at the discretion of the General Manager responsible for the departments identified in the Terms of Reference. Proposed new agency representatives have not yet been contacted and will not be contacted until City Council approves the Terms of Reference.

This report proposes that members of City Council would likewise be non-voting members should Council decide to continue to sit on advisory committees. As you will recall, the Governance Subcommittee previously recommended that members of City Council not sit on advisory committees. The decision was deferred until the draft Terms of Reference are considered. The Governance Subcommittee requires direction on the role Council members shall have on advisory committees. In the event that a member of Council continues to sit on advisory committees, the Governance Subcommittee recommends that the appointment of Council members to committees align with assigned strategic priority areas, where possible.

The Governance Subcommittee recommends that voting members be appointed for two-year staggered terms, for a maximum of six years, except as otherwise directed by Council. A uniform term will make the administration of appointments more efficient and is intended to balance the complement of existing and newly appointed members at the expiry of a term. The Governance Subcommittee is also recommending that no change occur to the current requirement that a three year break occur before reappointment to a committee after serving the maximum term. This will encourage a turn-over in membership with fresh ideas and perspectives being invited to sit on these committees.

Similar to the current reporting structure and the practices found in other jurisdictions, it is proposed that the advisory committees continue to report to a SPC on an annual basis. The draft Terms of Reference are consistent in requiring the advisory committees to submit an annual report, outlining the previous year's accomplishments and a work plan for the upcoming year. A prescribed form for reporting will be developed to facilitate the annual reporting requirement. Additionally, advisory committees are encouraged to provide reports updating on major initiatives or in reference to matters referred by a SPC or City Council.

Draft Terms of Reference for each of the proposed advisory committees planned for 2019 were prepared based on a review of existing mandates, other jurisdictions and with input from existing advisory committees. The proposed Terms of Reference for

each of the advisory committees planned for 2019 can be found at Attachment 2, along with copies of the current Terms of Reference, where appropriate, and information demonstrating the proposed changes.

If the proposed Terms of Reference are approved, the Governance Subcommittee will bring forward the required policy amendments to compliment the new advisory committee structure and Terms of Reference.

### **Summary of Advisory Committee Engagement**

All existing advisory committees were invited to provide feedback on the draft Terms of Reference relevant to their current mandates. Members of the Core Committee of the Governance Subcommittee attended the advisory committee meetings to introduce the draft Terms of Reference and answer questions. All advisory committees were asked to provide a written submission outlining comments, concerns and suggestions for change. Attachment 3 contains copies of the submissions received from each of the existing advisory committees. Many of the suggestions contained in the submissions were incorporated into the Terms of Reference.

Some of the more notable comments include that:

- Youth members may feel overwhelmed and intimidated sitting on an advisory committee. Through the engagement, the suggestion was that a committee member be assigned as a mentor. The Governance Subcommittee recommends that either the chair or vice-chair of the advisory committee or the member of Council appointed to sit on the advisory committee be assigned as a mentor to the youth member. The Terms of Reference reflect this mentorship requirement.
- The Street Activity Steering Committee (SASC) raised concerns about the broad mandate of the CWSC, expressing that their program mandate will be lost. The matters previously within the mandate of the SASC were considered in drafting the proposed CWSC Terms of Reference. In order to address the specific concerns, the Governance Subcommittee, as reflected in the CWSC Terms of Reference, proposes to create a standing committee of the CWSC composed of existing representation of the SASC. Issues specific to the pre-existing SASC can be reported through the CWSC to the SPC-PDCS, which is the reporting structure currently in place. Further, the Governance Subcommittee will be commencing the BID review. Within the context of that review, other mechanisms could be considered for reporting on issues specific to the BIDs.

The Governance Subcommittee acknowledges that the proposed CWSC Terms of Reference contain a broad mandate. Like the SASC, this comment was also expressed by the Administration. The ability to form ad hoc subcommittees is hopefully a tool that may be used to focus discussions or resources to particular issues. In addition, given that this is a new committee, the Governance Subcommittee recommends that a review of the mandate occur after the first year, with feedback and recommendations sought from the CWSC itself. Suggestions for change could be considered at that time.

Finally, at the suggestion of the Administration, “wellness” has been changed to “wellbeing” in the committee name.

- The Traffic Safety Committee (TSC) commented on the potential overlap in mandate and composition between the CWSC and the Vision Zero Group. Early suggestions of the Governance Subcommittee indicated that the mandate of the CWSC could include issues related to traffic safety and animals in the event that the TSC and the Animal Control Advisory Committee (ACAC) were disbanded. In accordance with these discussions, the CWSC mandate originally included some aspects of those mandates. However, in light of the TSC’s comments and given the establishment of the Vision Zero Group and the Animal Control Working Group, the Governance Subcommittee has removed those matters from the CWSC mandate. The composition of the new working groups will include all or some of the representatives from the current TSC and ACAC. Part of the rationale for disbanding the TSC and ACAC was to avoid duplication of work with City departments and other working groups. Further, this will help alleviate concerns regarding the broad scope of the CWSC mandate.
- PAAC questioned the rationale for having the committee report to SPC-FIN as opposed to SPC-PDCS. The intent was simply to have a balance in terms of the responsibility of the SPCs, as SPC-PDCS already has two advisory committees which report to it.
- The Saskatoon Environmental Advisory Committee (SEAC) requested the removal of agency representation, or in the alternative, classification of agency representatives as non-voting resource members. Traditionally, City of Saskatoon advisory committees have included agency representatives as voting members. The Governance Subcommittee has some concern that there may be less of a willingness for agencies to participate should their status be changed to non-voting. Further, citizen representation on SEAC continues to comprise the majority of the membership (10 citizens versus 3 agency representatives). Should a conflict of interest arise, the expectation would be that the member declare a conflict and remove themselves from any debate or vote. Conflict of interest is addressed in the onboarding and orientation material. The practice of voting and non-voting agency representation varies by jurisdiction. Should Council wish that the Governance Subcommittee revisit the voting status of agency representatives, this should be done for all advisory committees.
- In response to previous comments of MHAC about the size of the Advisory Committee, the Governance Subcommittee had suggested removing the BID and Saskatoon Public Library Board as voting members, and instead including them as non-voting resource members. However, apparent from MHAC’s comments, the preference is to have those agency representatives remain as voting members. The draft Terms of Reference reflect this preference.

### **Onboarding and Orientation**

Current onboarding and orientation materials for advisory committees include written materials on:

- the City’s municipal structure and authority;
- the role of advisory committees in general;

- meeting rules and procedures; and
- the role of the chair and other members.

In accordance with Council's direction, in addition to the written materials, an orientation/education session will be provided to all members at the first meeting of each advisory committee. It is the intent that such a session will include reference to and an overview of the advisory committee mandates, reporting structure, mentorship for the youth member and a review of the annual report template and expectations.

### **The Naming Advisory Committee**

In accordance with Council's direction, further engagement with the Naming Advisory Committee ensued after Council's meeting on November 20, 2017. The minutes of the Naming Advisory Committee held on March 8, 2018 wherein the future structure of the Naming Advisory Committee was discussed can be found at Attachment 4. In brief, the feedback provided to the Governance Subcommittee includes the following suggestions:

- change the name of the Committee as it is not truly advisory in nature;
- invite the Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Committee (Diversity, Equity and Inclusion as of January 1, 2019) to provide nominations and feedback on a regular basis;
- reassign delegation for the assignment of names to the Committee itself rather than to the Mayor;
- organize the Names Master List by forming neighbourhood themes; and
- revise the composition of the Committee to include any three members of Council and four members of the Administration, with a rotating Chair.

Continuation of the current structure, albeit with minor changes was contemplated as one of the options in the Governance Subcommittee's November, 2017 report. By definition, however, the existing form and function of the Committee is not *per se* advisory in nature.

In addition, having the Mayor responsible for naming is a distinct feature of Saskatoon's model. According to the common practice research conducted by the Governance Subcommittee (reported in November, 2017), the City's current Council/Administration Working Group is a popular model that is commonly used in other jurisdictions. As a result, the Governance Subcommittee recommends that the current structure continue, implementing the suggestions proposed by the existing Naming Advisory Committee. If this direction is confirmed by Council, the Governance Subcommittee will review and revise the existing Terms of Reference including mandate and composition, and propose amendments to *Policy No. C09-008, Naming of Civic Property and Development Areas Policy* to reflect the appropriate changes.

### **Public Art Advisory Committee**

In a letter submitted on behalf of PAAC, dated December 1, 2017, the Committee made the following requests:

1. that the composition of the Committee be increased to include two or more Indigenous members; and
2. that guidance on the role that the Committee might fulfill in responding to the Calls to Action contained in the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission be provided.

In accordance with the request of PAAC, the Governance Subcommittee recommends the addition of two members to the Committee from the First Nations or Métis community. The Governance Subcommittee agrees that a more diverse representation on the Committee will hopefully serve to provide a broader and deeper perspective to Committee deliberations and recommendations, and lead to a greater sense of community in the City's public spaces. Further, a statement referencing consideration of the Calls to Action contained in the Final Report of the Truth and Reconciliation Commission has been included in the proposed Terms of Reference.

### **Child Care Expenses**

Clause 2.11a) of *Policy C-01-003, Appointment to Civic Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees Policy* ("Appointment Policy") provides:

"Childcare Expenses – Citizen members will be reimbursed for childcare expenses for all meetings attended, up to a maximum of \$7.50 per hour upon submission of a receipt to the City Clerk's Office."

The Governance Subcommittee was asked to bring forth a review of the City's child care compensation rate in respect of child care expenses.

Available on-line information from the cities of London, Regina, Calgary, Edmonton, Winnipeg, Vancouver and Toronto demonstrates that only two (Edmonton and Toronto) of the seven jurisdictions offer reimbursement for child care expenses. While the City of London does not currently provide for the reimbursement of any child care expenses, London's policy is currently under review.

The City of Edmonton's *Agencies, Board, Committees and Commissions Policy (C575C)* provides, at paragraph 18(d):

"For City Agencies where remuneration is not provided, members that require child care in order to attend a regular meeting may be reimbursed for child care expenses upon submission of a receipt. Any child care arrangements outside regularly scheduled meetings, requires prior approval by the board chair, must be based on actual receipts submitted and be within existing budgets."

Similarly, section 9 of the City of Toronto's *Expense and Travel Reimbursement Policy For City Agencies, Boards, Commissions and Corporations* provides:

“Incidental childcare expenses as a result of attending Board meetings or on authorized Board business may be reimbursed where the Board deems financial hardship would otherwise result. Receipts must be provided.”

The benefit in each of Edmonton and Toronto is superior to Saskatoon’s in that reimbursement is contemplated not only for attendance at meetings, but also for other board business. In addition, with appropriate receipts, those jurisdictions do not provide for a cap on entitlement. In respect of the remaining jurisdictions surveyed, Saskatoon’s child care reimbursement benefits are superior.

Advisory committee chairs were asked questions about the adequacy of benefits offered during the initial round of engagement. In particular, the advisory committee chairs were asked whether:

- (a) the services provided for were adequate to encourage public participation; and
- (b) there were other benefits not currently provided that would help to ensure that no barriers exist to public participation.

The majority of responses indicated that the services offered are adequate. There appeared to be more concern in respect of meeting times and the dissemination of information about the committees and meetings.

Statistics provided by the City Clerk’s Office reveal that for 2016 and 2017, no requests for reimbursement of child care expenses were received from a member of any Board, Committee or Commission. Given the underutilization of these benefits, it is difficult to know whether any change is warranted in order to enhance public participation. Further, it is predicted that any budgetary impact of removing the hourly cap would likely be negligible.

Considering the research as described above, the Governance Subcommittee recommends that Council continue to offer reimbursement for child care expenses, but remove the cap of \$7.50 per hour. The current cap of \$7.50 per hour is below minimum wage. Removing the cap altogether is in line with the other jurisdictions that offer a similar benefit. Given the minimal utilization of this benefit, adding entitlement to reimbursement for board and committee business other than just meetings is not being recommended at this time. If usage increases, consideration of offering this benefit for other board and committee business could be revisited.

As the benefits appear to be minimally utilized, it would be prudent to remind members of the existence of these benefits. This can be achieved through the proposed onboarding and orientation. The revised Terms of Reference for each committee now also make reference to the benefits available. Any change to the benefits offered will require an amendment to the Appointment Policy.



### **Advisory Committee Diversity of Representation**

The addition of youth members, members of the LGBTQ2S community and additional indigenous and visible minority representation are all intended to encourage a more diverse representation on the City's advisory committees. In order to reach a larger number of communities to ensure diverse representation, the City Clerk's Office intends to advertise citizen vacancies through a broader spectrum of agencies, including various educational institutions, the School Boards, Out Saskatoon, the Open Door Society, Eagle Feather News and Youth Speaks YXE. The intent is to advertise vacancies outside of the traditional methods through the City's website and social media channels and the Star Phoenix.

In respect of age diversity in particular, in accordance with Council's direction on February 26, 2018, an optional field on the application form for citizen appointments to self-identify their age range will be included. The Governance Subcommittee proposes the following be included on the citizen appointment application form:

- the ability to self-declare as being 16-23, 24-55 or 55+ years old;
- a statement that the self-declaration is voluntary, with a box to indicate the applicant's preference not to answer; and
- a statement to indicate that the purpose of the self-declaration is to facilitate diverse representation of age groups on advisory committees.

Gender diversity in advisory committee representation is also addressed in the Appointment Policy which provides the following at section 2.7:

#### Representation on Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees

City Council has resolved that appointments to positions on Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees be truly representative of the population of women and men of the City of Saskatoon and, therefore, wishes to achieve gender equity for all Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees. City Council has also adopted a Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Policy.

### **Options to the Recommendation**

GPC could recommend variations of the Terms of Reference to City Council. Considering the results of the research and engagement, this option is not recommended. Recommended changes to the advisory committee structure have considered both the practices in other jurisdictions and the feedback received from the advisory committee engagement.

### **Public and/or Stakeholder Involvement**

Each of the advisory committees was engaged for comments and feedback on the proposed Terms of Reference. Members of the Core Committee of the Governance Subcommittee attended at each of the advisory committee meetings to introduce the draft Terms of Reference and field questions. The advisory committee submissions can be found at Attachment 2.

### **Communication Plan**

If the recommendations are adopted, existing advisory committees will be advised accordingly.

### **Policy Implications**

Adoption of Terms of Reference will necessitate policy amendments. Amendments to *Policy C10-023, The Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Policy* and *Policy C09-008, the Naming of Civic Property and Development Areas Policy* would be required. Similarly, amendments to *Policy C01-003, Appointments to Civic Boards, Commissions, Authorities, and Committees* will be forthcoming. Other policy implications may be identified as the Governance Review progresses.

### **Public Notice**

Public Notice pursuant to Section 3 of Policy No. C01-021, Public Notice Policy, is not required.

### **Attachments**

1. Advisory Committee Governance Structure - City Council Resolutions and Inquiries
2. Summary of Proposed Changes to Saskatoon Advisory Committees and the Proposed Terms of Reference for:
  - (a) Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee
  - (b) Advisory Committee on Community Wellbeing & Safety
  - (c) Public Art Advisory Committee
  - (d) Saskatoon Environmental Advisory Committee
  - (e) Advisory Committee on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion
  - (f) Saskatoon Accessibility Advisory Committee
3. Advisory Committee Engagement on Terms of Reference
  - (a) Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee
  - (b) Street Activity Steering Committee
  - (c) Animal Control Advisory Committee
  - (d) Traffic Safety Committee
  - (e) Public Art Advisory Committee
  - (f) Saskatoon Environmental Advisory Committee
  - (g) Cultural Diversity and Race Relations Committee
  - (h) Saskatoon Accessibility Advisory Committee
4. Minutes of the Naming Advisory Committee meeting held on March 8, 2018

### **Report Approval**

Written by: Christine G. Bogad, Director of Administrative & Municipal Law  
Shellie Bryant, Deputy City Clerk  
Candice Leuschen, Executive Assistant to the City Solicitor

Approved by: Patricia Warwick, City Solicitor  
Joanne Sproule, City Clerk  
Mike Jordan, Director of Policy & Government Relations