

Garbage Receptacles and Trail Side Amenities on Multi Use Pathways

ISSUE

City departments do not currently provide nor service garbage receptacles and trail side amenities on the vast majority of multi-use pathways (MUPs), other than those currently along the Meewasin Trails or embedded within City owned parks. This report is to provide information on current service levels and outline potential service level options that could be considered during the 2024/25 Business Plan and Budget deliberations in November 2023 or in future year's budget deliberations.

BACKGROUND

History

City Council, at its Regular Business Meeting held on November 21, 2022, considered Councillor Block's Notice of Motion, and resolved:

"That the City of Saskatoon has several multi-use pathways (MUPs) and an approved Active Transportation Plan that calls for more MUPs;

And whereas the design for multi-use pathways does not currently include locations/spaces or a level of service for garbage receptacles or other trail side amenities;

Therefore be it resolved that Administration report back on the current level of services for garbage receptacles and trail side amenities along MUPs, and provide options for consideration on a level of service for existing MUPs and new MUPs in time for the 2024-2025 multi-year budget deliberations."

CURRENT STATUS

The City of Saskatoon (City) currently does not have a consistent formalized standard for placement of garbage receptacles and benches along multi-use pathways. City records show that there are approximately 102 kilometres of paved off-road multi-use trails, including the Meewasin trails. Appendix 1 is a map of the entire network of multi-use pathways throughout Saskatoon, including the 29kms of Meewasin trails along the river valley.

Several departments provide garbage removal services throughout Saskatoon, and there are a variety of standards associated with a garbage removal schedule. The following departments provide garbage removal services on behalf of the City:

- Facilities Management (within the City owned facilities);
- Parks (along pathways within Parks, including the Meewasin Trails and River Landing);
- Roadways, Fleet and Support (along key commercial corridors including within the BIDS);

Garbage Receptacles and Trail Side Amenities on Multi Use Pathways

- Saskatoon Transit (at applicable Transit stops equipped with garbage receptacles); and
- Water and Waste Operations (for all residential and applicable industrial, commercial and institutional locations).

In general, garbage receptacles and/or benches are currently located in the Business Improvement Districts, in parks, at bus stops, within City-owned facilities, in individual residential and commercially owned properties and along Meewasin Valley Trail. There are also garbage receptacles located adjacent to MUPs on McOrmond Drive at Stensrud Road and on Lowe Road at Ag Canada Farm, on McOrmond Drive from Wanuskewin Drive to Kenaschuk Crescent (which were installed as part of the North Commuter Parkway (NCP) project), and on Central Avenue from McOrmond Drive to Attridge Drive (also as part of the NCP project).

Garbage receptacles and benches along the Meewasin Trails are typically installed as part of new trails and trail enhancements. Based on a high-level review, amenities are located on average every 250 metres in less dense areas, and much more prevalent in the downtown core along the busiest segments of the Meewasin Trails. Amenities that Meewasin typically includes in new trail development and trail enhancements includes trash receptacles, benches and other seating, signage (wayfinding, interpretive, regulatory), bike racks, and lighting (where appropriate). Meewasin currently has no formal design standard for the entire trail system, but the detailed design for each segment of trail, new or being upgraded, is reviewed and approved by the City prior to construction. Locations and quantities of garbage receptacles and trail side amenities for the Meewasin trails are currently determined on a site-by-site basis during the design process. Meewasin is planning on developing Trail Design Standards which would include a standardized approach for all amenities.

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS

City of Saskatoon's Current and Potential Future Approach with Multi-Use Pathways

As noted above, there are a number of Departments within the City that provide some level of service related to the installation maintenance and servicing of outdoor public garbage receptacles and outdoor benches.

Specific to MUPs, the Transportation Department's role on MUPs is currently limited to geometric design standards such as pathway width, horizontal and vertical alignment, roadway crossings, offset distances for garbage receptacles/benches and other amenities, and signage. This design work does not currently include location or type of garbage receptacles or benches as part of the design and construction costs and standards for MUPs.

Standards related to location and type of garbage receptacles, service standards and servicing of receptacles/benches along MUPs could be addressed by Facilities Management and Parks Departments as they have the operational knowledge, experience and equipment to provide these services as they currently provide similar type services to city parks and riverbank parks. Ultimately, any new approved and

funded service levels for the design standards and trail side amenity specifications could be built into future design specifications for all MUPs, and incorporated into the overall construction costs of new MUPs.

Going forward, should Council identify a level of service for trail side amenities for MUPs, Transportation, Facilities Management and Parks Departments are best suited to provide services on MUPs as follows:

1. Garbage receptacle and bench installation (location and type) – to be included in the final design specifications, and to be included as part of the construction contract for any new MUPs - Transportation
2. Garbage removal, including service standards – Parks
3. Garbage receptacle and bench maintenance – Facilities Management

Additional resources would be required as providing these services on MUPs would be a service level enhancement. The exact financial requirements are somewhat difficult to assess as they may differ between a department expanding a service they currently offer versus a department creating a completely new section to provide these services. Further details are outlined in the Financial Implications section below.

Approaches in Other Jurisdictions

A scan was completed of Canadian jurisdictions. Many jurisdictions have a Trails Master Plan, some of which detail the location of garbage receptacles and trail side amenities. Several municipalities that have a Trails Master Plan have a high number of hiking trails, and the Trails Master Plan is more geared toward hiking trails than MUPs.

Based on the jurisdictional scan, there was no consistent guidance across the jurisdictions. The recommended spacing for garbage receptacles and/or benches varied from 200 metres to 1.5 kilometres. Each jurisdiction varied on its guidance on whether a garbage receptacle needs to accompany each bench location (during summer season there can be wasp/insect related issues with benches and waste receptacles placed in close proximity). Edmonton, AB does not recommend garbage receptacles within residential neighbourhoods, while Red Deer, AB recommends garbage receptacles every 500 metres along neighbourhood trails.

A summary of the jurisdictional scan can be found in Appendix 2.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The estimated cost to supply and install garbage receptacles is \$2,200 per garbage receptacle. The estimated cost to supply and install benches is \$3,500 per bench. The estimated yearly cost to service the garbage receptacles, based on the Parks Departments current level of service, is \$470 per garbage receptacle per year, including both labour and equipment required. This is based on approximately 70 service visits per year, once per week in the winter/spring and two times per week in the summer. Further to this, the operating impact for the Facilities Management Department, including labour and materials for the maintenance and repairs of the amenities, is \$110/garbage receptacle/year and \$175/bench/year.

Appendix 3 shows the potential capital and operating costs of various service levels to address the existing kilometers of MUPs that do not have any trail side amenities. The scenarios presented are associated with the placement of garbage receptacles and benches at every 250 metres, 500 metres, 1 kilometre, and 1.5 kilometre for the existing multi-use pathways.

The total costs range from a high of \$1.676M capital with \$222,000 in annual operating costs for the installation of a bench and garbage receptacle every 250 metres along existing MUPS. The lower end of the range is \$285,000 capital with \$37,750 annual operating costs, for the installation of a bench and garbage receptable every 1.5 kilometres along existing MUPs. Recognizing there could be numerous variations of the scenarios and could contemplate the installation of only garbage receptacles or only benches.

Should there be a change to design specifications for trail side amenities along MUPs, future budget implications would be connected to the change in detailed design specifications for all new multi-use pathways and would be based on the level of service directed by Council. For example, if there is direction to have a garbage receptable and bench every 250 metres, the incremental capital cost would be \$22,800 per km of new MUP and the annual operating impact of \$3,020 per kilometre of new MUP.

OTHER IMPLICATIONS

There are no privacy, legal, or social implications identified. Environmental implications would be assessed based on what, if any, new service level, City Council may direct.

NEXT STEPS

Unless directed otherwise Administration will continue with the current service level provision for garbage receptacles and trail side amenities for multi-use pathways.

APPENDICES

1. Map – Multi-Use Pathways Throughout Saskatoon
2. Jurisdictional Scan Summary
3. Projected Capital and Operating Costs for Various Service Level Options

REPORT APPROVAL

Written by: Jay Magus, Director of Transportation

Reviewed by: Darren Crilly, Director of Parks

Pamela Hamoline, Acting Director of Facilities Management

Approved by: Terry Schmidt, General Manager, Transportation and Construction

Angela Gardiner, General Manager, Utilities and Environment

Lynne Lacroix, General Manager, Community Services