

Governance Review – Other Bodies – Albert Community Centre Management Committee and Marr Residence Management Board

ISSUE

The Albert Community Centre Management Committee (“Albert Centre”) and the Marr Residence Management Board (“Marr Residence”) are bodies established by City Council pursuant to section 55 of *The Cities Act*. Albert Centre and Marr Residence are “bodies” subject to review by the Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee (the “Governance Subcommittee”) as part of the governance review of the City’s Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Business Improvement Districts (“BIDs”) and other bodies established by the City.

The Albert Centre and Marr Residence have not undergone a governance or functional review for many years. What changes are required to improve the governance and operation of the Albert Centre and Marr Residence?

BACKGROUND

2.1 History

At the [February 13, 2017](#) meeting of the Governance and Priorities Committee (“GPC”), the Committee resolved:

That the project parameters for the review of governance structures, models, practices and procedures of Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Business Improvement Districts (“BID”) and any other agency, board or commission established by the City of Saskatoon be approved.

Extensive reporting has already occurred for the Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Board of Revision, as well as the BIDs and the Appeal Boards. That work remains ongoing.

At its [Regular Business Meeting on June 29, 2020](#), City Council considered a report from the Governance Subcommittee entitled “Governance Review – Other Bodies Established by Council” and resolved the following:

1. That the Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee review the following other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council:
 - a. Albert Community Centre Management Board;
 - b. Marr Residence Management Board;
 - c. Social Services Subcommittee;
 - d. Municipal Planning Commission; and
 - e. All of the Appeal Boards identified in this report and appendices; and
2. That the Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee report further on:
 - a. Recommended changes to the Terms of Reference, including mandates and composition of the other agencies, boards and committees; and
 - b. Bylaw and policy amendments required to implement any changes.

At its [December 20, 2021 Regular Business Meeting](#), City Council approved the following appointments, as recommended by GPC:

That Councillor Cynthia Block be reappointed to the Albert Community Centre Management Committee until April 30, 2022, and that following this date, City representation be changed from City Council and a member of the Administration to only a member of the Administration, appointed by City Council, and that the Terms of Reference be updated accordingly; and

That Councillor David Kirton be reappointed to the Marr Residence Management Board to the conclusion of the 2022 Annual General Meeting of the Board, or April 30, 2022, whichever comes first, and that following this date, City representation be changed from City Council to a member of the Administration, appointed by City Council, and that the Terms of Reference be updated accordingly.

This report reviews the Albert Centre and Marr Residence. Separate reporting will occur regarding the Social Services Subcommittee, Development Appeals Board and Municipal Planning Commission.

2.2 Current Status

Albert Centre

The Albert Centre currently operates as a cooperative community centre. It is owned by the City and located at 610 Clarence Avenue South, on the corner of Clarence Avenue and 12th Street.

The Albert Centre opened as a community centre in 1985. Today, the Albert Centre is managed by the Management Committee. The main purpose of the Albert Centre is to provide affordable space to non-profit organizations and similar low-cost activities run by organizations or individuals. The purpose of the Management Committee is to supervise the operation of the Albert Centre. There are several long-term tenants which lease space in the facility by lease agreement with the City. Individuals or other organizations are also able to rent space in the building for various short-term events.

Marr Residence

The Marr Residence currently operates as a museum-type historical interpretive centre that provides programming to promote the arts and Saskatoon's historical heritage. The Marr Residence is a one and a half story house located at 326 – 11th Street East and is the oldest building in Saskatoon still on its original site. The house was built in 1884 by Alexander "Sandy" Marr and his family. The Marr Residence is owned by the City and was officially designated as a Municipal Heritage Property on January 1, 1982.

Today, the Marr Residence is operated by the Management Board. Its purpose is to manage all aspects of the Marr Residence property, with the objectives of maintaining and enhancing the historical integrity of the site, providing public access to the site and providing heritage programs which increase public awareness of Saskatoon's heritage. The building is also available for rentals to non-profit groups or individuals for special events.

A more detailed description of the history of the Albert Centre and Marr Residence is contained in Appendix 1.

2.3 Public Engagement

This report will be shared with the Albert Centre Committee and Marr Residence Board when it becomes public. In accordance with established practice, this report will be tabled and the Albert Centre Committee and Marr Residence Board will be invited to provide feedback for consideration by GPC in advance of the report being debated. It is anticipated that this report will be brought back to GPC at its December 12, 2023 meeting for debate.

2.4 City of Saskatoon's Current Approach

Albert Centre

Since its opening as a community centre, the Albert Centre has been operated by a management committee whose membership currently totals seven and includes one City employee (appointed by City Council), five volunteer members of the public and one non-voting representative selected by the long-term tenants. Except for the non-voting representative, all citizen members of the Committee are appointed by City Council via the process identified in the Terms of Reference for the City Agency Recruitment and Evaluation Committee ("CARE"). All committee members serve on a volunteer basis, serve one-year terms and receive no remuneration.

Currently, the official mandate of the Albert Centre Management Committee is to:

- (a) determine the users of the buildings;
- (b) determine rental policy and fees for approval by City Council;
- (c) determine eligibility criteria for tenants and make recommendations for any changes;
- (d) approve all redecorating requests and report to the Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee for information;
- (e) submit all requests for structural changes to the Community Services Department for appropriate building permits and to City Council and the Municipal Heritage Advisory Committee for final approval;
- (f) oversee that use of building reflects preferences and needs of the community; and
- (g) hear submissions from the community and tenants.

Members of the Management Committee are appointed on an annual basis and the qualifications for membership are:

- knowledge of property management;
- knowledge of contracting;
- experience in budgeting; and
- Criteria for Appointments as per Policy No. C01-003, *Appointment to Civic Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees* ("C01-003") including:
 - expressed interest of the individual;
 - past involvement and demonstrated contribution of time and effort;
 - residence within the boundaries of Saskatoon.

The Management Committee reports to City Council through the Standing Policy Committee on Planning, Development and Community Services (“PDCS”).

Meeting support is provided by a volunteer secretary who also serves as secretary to the Marr Residence Board. There do not appear to be publicly available meeting procedures. Agendas are sent out prior to meetings and motions are passed when quorum is available. The Committee meets monthly, excepting July and August.

Marr Residence

Since 1995, the Marr Residence has been managed by the Management Board whose membership currently totals seven, and includes one representative from the Nutana Community Association, one representative from the Saskatoon Heritage Society, one City employee (appointed by City Council) and four members of the general public. All citizen members of the Board are appointed by City Council via the process identified in the Terms of Reference for CARE. All board members serve on a volunteer basis, serve two-year terms and receive no remuneration.

Currently, the official mandate of the Management Board is to:

- (a) recommend policies for approval by City Council, including policies for the restoration of the property, the acquisition and consideration of artifacts and the role of the Board (day-to-day operations and financial matters);
- (b) develop and recommend a strategic plan for approval by City Council, such a plan to be updated at least every five years;
- (c) raise money to fund restoration projects;
- (d) ensure that all usage of the property, including programming, rentals, and leases, is of a heritage, arts, or neighbourhood character;
- (e) maintain the property in accordance with *The Heritage Property Act* and Bylaw No. 6208, *A Bylaw of the City of Saskatoon to designate Lot 15, in Block 41, Plan No. (Q1) B 1858 as municipal heritage property*;
- (f) provide an annual report to City Council which demonstrates how the Marr Residence Management Board is working to fulfill its mandate and to implement its strategic plan.

The qualifications sought for members are:

- Volunteer or professional experience in one or more of the following areas:
 - heritage program delivery;

- community development;
- community associations;
- property management;
- architecture;
- administration;
- tourism or fundraising; and
- Criteria for Appointments as per C01-003 including:
 - expressed interest of the individual;
 - past involvement and demonstrated contribution of time and effort;
 - residence within the boundaries of Saskatoon.

The Terms of Reference indicate that the Management Board reports to City Council. In practice, it appears that the Marr Residence Management Board, like the Albert Centre Management Committee reports to City Council through PDCS. For example, the Management Board's 2022 Marr Residence Annual Report was presented at the January 11, 2023 meeting of PDCS.

Meeting support is provided by a volunteer secretary who also serves as secretary to the Albert Centre Committee. There do not appear to be publicly available meeting procedures. Agendas are sent out prior to meetings and motions are passed when quorum is available. The Board meets monthly, excepting December.

2.5 Approaches in Other Jurisdictions

The Governance Subcommittee reviewed the cities of Victoria, Vancouver, Edmonton, Calgary, Regina, Winnipeg, Toronto, Barrie, Halifax, and St. John's to determine whether they have similar boards or committees, which are not part of a controlled corporation, to oversee museums or community centres owned by them.

The cities of Victoria, Edmonton, Calgary, Regina, Barrie, Halifax and St. John's do not appear to have similar boards or committees.

The cities of Vancouver, Winnipeg and Toronto appear to appoint similar types of boards or committees to oversee similar types of facilities. General observations about these boards/committees are as follows:

- The memberships are made up of citizen volunteers appointed by the respective City Councils. The composition of each includes a member of Council. Except for Vancouver, the member of Council is appointed as a voting member. Only Vancouver specifies that the member of Council is appointed as a non-voting liaison.

- The sizes range from four to 16 members. The majority are made up of nine members.
- The majority have some stipulations for membership: such as at least one member must be a resident of the area in which the facility is located, or that the current membership appoint a particular person to serve.
- The majority are appointed for two-year terms, with the members of Council appointed on an annual basis.

The City of Toronto, while it appoints boards to oversee community centres owned by the City, also owns Toronto History Museums, which is a collection of 10 historic sites. The City's Economic Development & Culture Division, Business Unit Museum and Heritage Services operates these 10 historic sites. The staff in this Business Unit manage, maintain, and lead the development and adaptive reuse and restoration of 100 City-owned major cultural and heritage sites. It does not appear that any of these sites are managed by a board or a committee.

Further information is detailed in Appendix 2 – Other Jurisdictions – Similar Boards/Committees to Albert Community Centre and Marr Residence.

OPTIONS

As the Albert Centre Committee and the Marr Residence Board are bodies established by the City pursuant to section 55 of *The Cities Act*, in order to ensure legislative compliance with subsection 55.1(5) of *The Cities Act*, all options detailed below require the Albert Centre Management Committee and the Marr Residence Management Board to adopt formal meeting procedures and make them publicly available.

Option 1 – Status Quo

This option proposes no change to the current governance structure and function of the Albert Centre and Marr Residence. Both would continue to operate with no change to the mandate of the committees, to the terms of appointment and to the required qualifications for public members. The current composition of each committee would remain the same, including the absence of a member of City Council and the appointment of a member of Administration, appointed by City Council.

Maintaining the status quo would keep a minor variation between the two management bodies in the appointment term lengths of one year for Albert Centre members and two years for Marr Residence members. Given what appears to be the current practice of Marr Residence reporting through PDCS (despite the language of the current Terms of Reference), this option would include a minor housekeeping amendment to the Marr Residence Terms of Reference to confirm reporting to City Council through PDCS. This is consistent

with current practice, the delegated authority of PDCS and the Albert Centre Terms of Reference.

Apart from ensuring legislative compliance as a board/committee established by the City under section 55 of *The Cities Act*, there are no other financial, legal, or other implications of maintaining the status quo.

Advantages:

- No major changes requiring implementation.
- Continued connection between the City and these entities through appointment of a member of Administration.
- Continued stakeholder and public input in how the facilities are operated.
- Updates the Terms of Reference and ensures legislative compliance.

Disadvantages:

- Different terms of appointment as between the membership of these entities.
- Continued requirement for recruitment and appointment of members.

Option 2 – Maintain Separate Governance of the Facilities with:

- **Continued Appointment of a Member of Administration as a Voting Member**
- **Two-Year Appointment Terms Consistent Between Management Bodies**
- **Addition of a Second Non-Voting Administration Member (Community Development Representative) to the Albert Centre Committee**

This option proposes that the Albert Centre and the Marr Residence continue to be operated by their respective management bodies; the existing member of the Administration appointed would continue to be designated as a voting member. The proposal to increase the composition of the Albert Centre Committee to include an additional member of the Administration as a non-voting liaison from Recreation and Community Development is a result of engagement with the Community Services Division.

This option also proposes that the terms of the public appointments for each of the management bodies would be for two years, which is consistent with the rest of the boards and committees established by City Council (a change to the one-year term for Albert Community Centre members).

This option does not propose any change to the mandate or required qualifications of the public members. Given what appears to be the current practice of Marr Residence reporting through PDCS (despite the language of the current Terms of Reference), this option would include a minor housekeeping amendment to the Marr Residence Terms of Reference to confirm reporting to City Council through PDCS to make it consistent with current practice, the

delegated authority of PDCS and the Albert Centre Terms of Reference. Apart from ensuring legislative compliance as a board/committee established by the City under section 55 of *The Cities Act*, there are no other financial, legal, or other implications of option 2.

Advantages:

- Continued connection between the City and the committee through appointment of members of Administration.
- Accords with common practice in other jurisdictions.
- Makes the term of appointment the same as other similar City committees.
- Continued stakeholder and public input in how the facilities are operated.
- Updates the Terms of Reference and ensures legislative compliance.

Disadvantages:

- Continued requirement for recruitment and appointment of members.

Option 3 – Disband the Albert Centre Management Committee and the Marr Residence Management Board and Create One New Board/Committee to Manage Both Facilities

This option proposes that both the Albert Centre Management Committee and the Marr Residence Management Board be disbanded, and that one new management committee be struck to oversee the operation of both facilities. Both properties are heritage properties, are in the Nutana neighbourhood of Saskatoon, are currently operated in a similar manner, and currently utilize the same secretary. The following would apply to creation of the new board:

- The current mandates of both the Albert Centre Management Committee and the Marr Residence Management Board would be combined.
- There are currently a total of nine public members appointed to both management bodies (five members on Albert and four members on Marr). The number could be reduced to a range of five to seven who have expertise in a combination of qualifications, which are derived from the current qualifications:
 - knowledge of property management;
 - knowledge of contracting;
 - experience in budgeting and administration;
 - knowledge in heritage programming;
 - knowledge in community development and community associations;
 - knowledge in architecture; and
 - knowledge in tourism and fundraising.
- The appointment of other specified members of the public would be maintained on the new committee:
 - one non-voting representative nominated by the tenants of the Albert Centre;
 - one representative from the Nutana Community Association; and

- one representative from the Saskatoon Heritage Society.
- Maintain the appointment of City employees, appointed by City Council.
- Terms of appointment for two years.
- Meetings to occur monthly.
- Maintain the current secretary and require the selection of a chair and vice-chair from among the voting membership.
- Require the new committee to adopt formal meeting procedures. Assistance from the Governance Subcommittee could be offered.
- The new committee would report to City Council through PDCS.
- The appointment process would remain the same by City Council through CARE.

There would likely be little to no financial, legal or other implications other than it would be one committee administering the budgets for the two facilities.

Advantages:

- A potential reduction in required appointments of between four to seven people.
- Continued connection between the City and the committee through appointment of members of Administration.
- Continued reporting to City Council through the same SPC.
- Continued appointments made by City Council through the CARE process.
- The preferred range of qualifications to sit on the new committee would remain the same, retaining the special expertise utilized to operate these facilities.

Disadvantages:

- The combination would result in a large mandate for one committee to manage. Despite the similarities between the two facilities, there is some variation in their mandates.
- Reducing the number of public members may result in some loss of expertise on the committee.

RECOMMENDATION

That the Governance and Priorities Committee recommend to City Council:

1. That separate governance of the facilities be maintained with continued appointment of a member of Administration as a voting member; two-year appointment terms consistent between management bodies; and the addition of a second non-voting Administration member (Community Development Representative) to the Albert Centre Committee (Option 2);
2. That the Administration amend the Terms of Reference as required; and
3. That the Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee assist the Albert Centre Committee and the Marr Residence Board in preparing Meeting Procedures for adoption and public access.

RATIONALE

Option 2 proposes to maintain separate governance bodies for each of the Albert Community Centre and the Marr Residence but change the appointment term of Albert Community Centre Committee members to two years to make their terms consistent with the terms of appointment for the rest of the boards and committees established by City Council, including the Marr Residence Board. It is unknown what the rationale for this existing difference is, but there appears to be no vital reason to maintain this distinction.

Like option 1, a housekeeping amendment to the Terms of Reference is contemplated in option 2 to ensure the Terms of Reference reflect the current reporting practices of the Marr Residence to City Council through PDCS. Receiving such reporting is within the delegated authority of PDCS and in line with the current reporting structure of the Albert Centre.

The decision to remove members of City Council from sitting as members on these boards was previously approved in 2021. There has been no reasons identified to revisit this decision. The time commitment of members of City Council for the participation on boards and committees is significant and the necessary liaison between the City and these facilities can be achieved by including a representative from Administration on these management entities. While the Governance Subcommittee has recommended to make members of Administration non-voting liaisons for other boards and committees, the recommendation here is to maintain the voting membership of the existing members of the Administration appointed to sit on the Albert Centre Committee and the Marr Residence Board. We understand those existing Administration members are from the Facilities Management Department. Given the mandate of these boards to manage civic facilities, participation by these members may

function more similar to controlled corporation boards rather than advisory or other City committees where members of the public are appointed.

The recommendation to increase the composition of the Albert Centre Committee to add a member of Administration from Recreation and Community Development results from engagement with the Community Services Division. The request was to add a resource member to act as a non-voting liaison. The Governance Subcommittee was advised that such an addition could add value by providing programming support.

No readily apparent reason was identified to justify disbanding these individual management entities and replacing them with a single management board. There are sufficient differences between these facilities and the mandates of the management entities to justify maintaining their governance with separate bodies.

While combining the boards may serve to reduce the number of required members, historically, the City Clerk's Office has not faced the same recruitment challenges for these boards as for some of the other bodies established by the City.

Meeting Procedures

The Albert Centre Committee and the Marr Residence Board are both bodies established by City Council under section 55 of *The Cities Act*. Subsection 55.1(5) requires that "...all council committees, controlled corporations and other bodies established by the council have publicly available written procedures for conducting business at meetings". Neither management body currently has publicly available meeting procedures. There is nothing accessible on either website.

The purpose of the meeting procedures is to ensure that bodies established by the City conduct themselves openly and transparently. To that end, *The Cities Act* requires the open and proper conduct of meetings that are tasked with managing these City facilities particularly in circumstances where, as here, the secretarial function for these boards is not sourced to the City Clerk's Office. It is anticipated that basic meeting procedures that would include minimal requirements to develop and post meeting agendas and minutes and ensure that quorum is achieved and that decisions are properly documented would suffice.

The process of other bodies established by the City to date has been to have the board or committee adopt the procedures at a meeting and report them to City Council through the appropriate Standing Policy Committee for information; in this case PDCS. The meeting procedures are then to be posted publicly. To comply with this requirement, they could simply be made available on their websites.

The Governance Subcommittee recently assisted the BIDs in the process to prepare and adopt their meeting procedures and would undertake to assist the Albert Centre and the Marr Residence to do the same.

ADDITIONAL IMPLICATIONS/CONSIDERATIONS

The various implications and considerations have been outlined for each option in the Options section above.

COMMUNICATION ACTIVITIES

If the Governance Subcommittee's recommendations are adopted, communication will be required surrounding the implementation of the changes. The City Clerk's Office will coordinate any such communications.

APPENDICES

1. History of the Albert Community Centre and Marr Residence
2. Other Jurisdictions – Similar Boards/Committees to Albert Community Centre and Marr Residence

Report Approval

Written by: Christine G. Bogad, Director of Legal Services
Shellie Bryant, Deputy City Clerk – Director of Legislative Services
Candice Leuschen, Executive Assistant to the City Solicitor

Reviewed by: Mike Jordan, Chief Public Policy and Government Relations Officer
Adam Tittlemore, City Clerk
Jeff Jorgenson, City Manager

Approved by: Cindy Yelland, City Solicitor