

Triple Bottom Line Review for the Proposed New Central Library

The following Triple Bottom Line (TBL) review of the proposed central library was conducted as a response to the motion made by the Governance and Priorities Committee on September 23, 2019: “That the Administration submit a report to the Governance and Priorities Committee on the library business plan encompassing all factors in the review: Financial, Environment, Community Well-Being and Reconciliation.”

Process and Methodology

Administration used the City of Saskatoon’s draft TBL Decision Making Tool to conduct a high level review of the proposed central library. When conducting a TBL analysis, it is appropriate to compare two or more projects or options so that a proposal can be evaluated against the status quo. As a result, the existing central library was reviewed as well.

In conducting the analysis, the Administration consulted documents provided by the Saskatoon Public Library (SPL), and conducted a follow-up interview with the SPL project team to gain a full understanding of both the proposed and existing libraries. Documents reviewed include:

- SPL – New Central Library Business Case, September 2019
- SPL – Background: Cost Analysis
- SPL Background: Borrowing & Mill-Rate Impact
- SPL Background: Strategic Alignment
- SPL – Report to GPC – Functional Program Analysis, October 2019
- SPL – Report to GPC – Decentralization, October 2019

This review is meant as a high level assessment to identify the proposed central library’s alignment with environmental, social, economic, and governance outcomes, as well as to identify opportunities to achieve even greater sustainability benefits. The results are meant to support ongoing decision making processes, rather than be relied upon as a fixed sustainability evaluation.

Caveats and Limitations:

- The Triple Bottom Line Council Policy has not yet come into effect; it will do so on January 1, 2020.
- As per 3.2 of the Policy: “Unless otherwise directed, this policy does not apply to any corporations wholly owned by the City of Saskatoon or statutory boards directly appointed by City Council.”
- The TBL Decision Making Tool was not yet developed at the time that SPL created its business case. Had the tool been available to and/or had it been an expectation at the time of business case development, it may have influenced the types of information included in SPL’s proposal.
- Some areas were considered out of scope. These included SPL’s general operations, as well as items that were not contingent on and/or influenced by the construction of a new building.

Results & Findings

The TBL evaluation was completed from the perspective of: “If the new central library were to achieve the vision, goals, and intentions stated by the Saskatoon Public Library, what would the potential impact be for each Triple Bottom Line success measure?”

Overall, the results of Administration’s TBL review indicate that:

- Many efforts have already been made by SPL to align the proposed new central library with environmental, social, economic, and governance outcomes.
- The proposed new central library would achieve greater TBL benefits than continuing to operate the existing central library in its current location.
- At this early stage of the project, SPL still has opportunities to make changes to the project that could result in additional positive impact. Opportunities to enhance certain TBL elements exist (see the “For Further / Future Consideration” sections later in this document).

A summary of results for each TBL pillar and indicator are in the subsequent section of this document. Outcomes are listed for each indicator with a summary of clarifying comments. To provide context, a numerical description of the outcomes are shown in Table 1.

Table 1

| TBL Score | TBL Outcome |
|------------------|--------------------------|
| Below 0% | Not Meeting Expectations |
| 0-19% | Needs Improvement |
| 20-39% | On-Track |
| 40-59% | Meeting Expectations |
| 60-79% | Exceeding Expectations |
| Above 80% | Leading the Way |

Principle: Environmental Health and Integrity**TBL Outcome - by Principle:**

New Central Library: Exceeding Expectations

Existing Library: Not Meeting Expectations

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

| Indicator | Proposed New Library | Existing Library |
|--|--|---|
| Renewable Energy | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to design the building to support solar power. | Not Meeting Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Does not include renewables. |
| Conservation of Resources | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed library is targeting LEED Gold. Proposes to include water- and energy-efficient equipment and fixtures. Proposes to include low-energy lighting. Libraries reduce consumption through the sharing of resources, technology, spaces, and programming, which the new library proposes to support on a larger scale than the existing library. | Needs Improvement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There have been no intentional water conservation measures put into place. Some LED lights and motion sensors have been installed. Most of the mechanical and electrical systems are original to the building. Upgrades to glazing, HVAC system, insulation, and air / vapour barrier is required to meet environmental control and energy performance standards. |
| Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> By targeting LEED Gold, the new library is aiming to reduce GHGs. Proposes to incorporate climate adaptation into the building design and its programming, as well as play a role in reducing risks to people during or after climate-related events. The central library intends to continue offering computers, internet access, phone charging, and a heated/cooled space, which may be used by people displaced during an emergency. Proposes to include signage on the spaces intended as tornado shelters (i.e. washrooms). | Needs Improvement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not currently measuring GHG emissions. No climate adaptation strategy in place. Offers computer and internet access, phone charging, and a heated/cooled space, which may be used by people displaced during an emergency. |
| Green Buildings and Sustainable Land Use | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The new library has budgeted for LEED Gold. If the new location has existing building(s) or infrastructure on site, LEED awards points for the reuse or salvaging of building materials. Indoor air quality standards are intended to meet LEED requirements. A central location is being proposed for the new library, which would support infill and density. | Needs Improvement: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The current building has not been built or renovated to green building standards. The existing building has identified National Building and Fire Code deficiencies. As stated in the business case, Building Standards determined that architectural improvements will not be permitted without the non-compliant elements being addressed. |

| | | |
|-------------------------------|---|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A central location ensures connectivity to existing infrastructure and services. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The existing library supports infill and density due to its central location. A central location also ensures connectivity to existing infrastructure and services. |
| Sustainable Transportation | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The potential new location intends to be adjacent to public transit and accessible by bike and foot. • Proposes employee bike storage, outdoor bike storage for the public, appropriate bike rack locations, and better sight lines and/or security to prevent bike theft. • Proposes limited parking on site for staff and no public parking, which is intended to encourage the use of public or active transportation and/or carpooling. • Proposes to centralize operations within a new central library, which would reduce the amount of commuting between branches by staff. | <p>Needs Improvement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The current library is located adjacent to public transit and accessible by bike and foot. • Includes bike racks and is close to the existing downtown bus mall. • The library current lends bike locks to patrons. • There is very limited parking. • Currently, staff commuting between branches is required because of office and meeting room space limitations at the central library. |
| Healthy Ecosystems | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposes to include outdoor and indoor green space. • The building design will consider ways to reduce bird strikes. • Proposes to reduce Heat Island Effect, as per LEED requirements. • Proposes to be Dark Sky Compliant by using outdoor lighting to reduce light pollution, as per LEED requirements. | <p>Not Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No indoor or outdoor green space exists at the current library. |
| Clean Air, Water, and Land | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LEED awards points for reducing pollution from construction activities by controlling soil erosion, waterway sedimentation, and airborne dust. • Proposes to exceed building code standards regarding water fountains, bottle filling stations, and washrooms for free public use. | <p>Not Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does not provide sufficient bathrooms or water fountains (does not meet code). |
| Waste Reduction and Diversion | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Proposes to develop a waste management plan for the building with a goal of diverting both organics and recyclables. • LEED awards points for construction & demolition waste management, as well as for buildings that provide dedicated areas accessible to waste haulers and building occupants for the collection and storage of recyclable materials. • Proposes to provide more opportunities to support and facilitate a sharing | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The facility has recycling options. • SPL does not use/provide bottled water and includes dishwashers to facilitate use of reusable dishes by staff. The library will continue to seek opportunities to reduce single use and non-recyclable / non-compostable items. |

| | | |
|-------------------------|--|--|
| | <p>economy approach through resource sharing (e.g. books, technology, audio-visual materials, spaces, etc.).</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to continue its practise of cleaning up litter adjacent to its site. | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library supports a sharing economy approach through resource sharing. SPL has switched from plastic to compostable plastic bags for use by patrons who need them. Part of SPL's maintenance process is to clean up litter adjacent to their site. |
| Storm Water Management | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to meet the City's storm water management requirements. The outdoor green space intends to reduce the amount and increase the quality of storm water runoff. SPL is considering options for a green roof element for the building. | <p>Not Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> No permeable surfaces. No storm water management solutions have been integrated on site. |
| Sustainable Food System | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to include a demonstration kitchen. This new space would be intended for cooking- and food-related educational programming. SPL plans to use a local vendor for its new cafe that offers healthy, local, and/or sustainable food options. Proposes to use the same pest management standards for its landscaping that the City uses (i.e. Integrated Pest Management). | <p>On Track:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Educational programming is currently provided around sustainable food. There is no demonstration kitchen space. There are no food offerings available at the current library. |

For Further / Future Consideration

- GHG measurement and verification could be conducted on both the existing building (as a baseline) and the new building (upon construction).
- SPL is interested in integrating learnings from [The City of Saskatoon's Adaptation Strategy](#) (i.e. a climate adaptation lens could be applied to the building design, SPL operations and procedures, and programming).
- SPL would welcome opportunities to discuss incorporating other green building methodologies to enhance their environmental outcomes. For example, Action 1 from the [Low Emissions Community Plan](#) is for all new municipal buildings to meet Passive House Standards, which could be considered for the new library (in conjunction with LEED).*
- Consideration could also be given to certify the project to LEED and/or Passive House standards. This would ensure outcomes are measured and could be used for verification and accountability of sustainability objectives.*

*The incorporation of green building standards (beyond LEED Gold) was not included in the budget, nor was building certification. As such, SPL would need to draw from the project contingency if these activities lead to additional costs.

Principle: Social Equity and Cultural Wellbeing**TBL Outcome - by Principle:**

New Central Library: Leading the Way

Existing Library: Meeting Expectations

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

| Indicator | Proposed New Library | Existing Library |
|---|--|--|
| Equity and Opportunity | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to enhance equality in Saskatoon by providing access to library programs, services, and collections, as well as free and welcoming spaces for people to gather. Proposes to integrate Indigenous perspectives into the overall building design. Proposes to include a dedicated ceremony space, multi-purpose room with venting to allow for smudging, the creation of a new oral story collection, and an elder-in-residence. The space is meant for all ages. It proposes the inclusion of an indoor play space & structure. Proposes to include gender-neutral washrooms. Proposes to offer specialized accessible equipment for people with differing abilities. Proposes to offer free and equal access to library services, regardless of age, gender, ethnicity, income, abilities, or other barriers. | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library provides free and equal access to library services, regardless of age, gender, ethnicity, income, abilities, or other barriers. The new library will enhance opportunities to achieve these outcomes. The existing library does not have a play structure for children; a dedicated ceremony or ventilated smudging area; or an elder-in-residence. |
| Diversity, Accessibility, and Inclusion | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to include Universal Design (accessibility standards) in the functional plan. Proposes to exceed both the National Building Code and the City of Saskatoon's Facility Accessibility Design Standards (FADS). Proposes to be the first fully accessible public building constructed using FADS. Proposes to meet the demands of diverse user needs and provide more opportunities for partnerships, over the short and long term due to expanded and flexible space. | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL studies and responds to community demographics. SPL has done what it can to improve the accessibility of the existing central library; however, the building limits the types and scale of improvements that can be made. The current library does not meet accessibility standards. |
| Heritage and Culture | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to include an expanded library collection. Proposes to integrate art and culture into the space, including: an art gallery for new and emerging local artists; the creation of a | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Offers a diverse library collection. The current library also has an art gallery and local history room. |

| | | |
|--|--|---|
| | <p>new Oral Stories collection; a dedicated ceremony space; and a theatre.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to meet the City's Public Art Policy. Proposes to construct an expanded Local History space with fire-protected storage for irreplaceable materials. | |
| Self Sufficiency and Living with Dignity | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to support poverty reduction and housing-placement initiatives and partnerships. Proposes to enhance SPL's ability to support people through education and programming, as well as free access to resources, technology, and safe spaces. | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library supports people to get out of poverty through education, partnerships, resources, support, literacy, programming, and safe spaces for children, teens and adults. |
| Health and Wellbeing | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to support literacy and employability initiatives, which have been shown to address social determinants of health (i.e. literacy rates are directly correlated to the overall health and prosperity of communities). Proposes to provide additional places to gather that are safe, comfortable, and welcoming. Proposes to support spiritual wellbeing, by having an elder-in-residence and space for smudging and ceremony. Proposes to continue offering the support of Outreach Workers. | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library provides health related services and training, such as AIDS testing and staff training on health and mental health. The central library has Outreach Workers who connect patrons with a variety of needs and services available in the community. |
| Safety and Resiliency | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to be designed with safety in mind (e.g. the new facility will provide better sight lines, install security cameras in appropriate locations, and conduct a complete CPTED review). Proposes to continue the practices of lending bike locks, offering phone charging, implementing security protocols, upholding privacy protocols, and working with community partners to provide safety solutions. | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Existing measures include: outreach workers, bike lock lending, free phone charging, security cameras, and security & privacy protocols. The central library tracks incidents and make changes to their operations to improve outcomes, where possible. SPL collaborates with partners to provide community-based safety solutions at the library. |
| Civic Participation | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The proposed library could potentially function as a polling station due to expanded space and configuration. Proposes to include additional/enhanced spaces that could be utilized for volunteer activities and to support partner organizations. | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The central library gives out free bus passes on voting days. The existing library provides access to spaces for volunteer activities. |

| | | |
|------------|--|--|
| Recreation | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Proposes to offer enhanced leisure opportunities to the community (i.e. the library will offer multi-use space for small and large public gatherings, programs, events, and performances).• Proposes to become a tourist destination.• Proposes to animate the downtown core and support place-making. | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The existing library is not known as a tourist attraction, nor a key place-making site. |
|------------|--|--|

Principle: Economic Benefits**TBL Outcome - by Principle:**

New Central Library: Exceeding Expectations

Existing Library: Needs Improvement

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

| Indicator | Proposed New Library | Existing Library |
|---------------------------|---|---|
| Innovation | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to facilitate learning, innovation, and technology by allowing for enhanced opportunities in these areas. Proposes to be a leader in achieving Indigenous and Reconciliation outcomes. | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library supports learning, innovation and technology. The new library will enhance opportunities to achieve these outcomes with the new spaces. |
| Sustainable Procurement | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> A "sustainability premium" is factored into the budget to meet LEED Gold. LEED awards points for selecting products from manufacturers who have verified improved environmental life-cycle impacts. Proposes to meet or exceed the City's Indigenous Procurement Protocol for procurement documents related to construction and design. | <p>On Track:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL follows City procurement practices. |
| Support the Local Economy | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Is estimated to have direct and indirect impacts on the economy. For example, according to SPL's business case: "Libraries often attract other progressive businesses, cultural organizations and residential ventures, leading to economic diversification." And one-time economic impacts are anticipated over the course of the 3-year construction period, including over 1,040 FTE jobs, mostly in SK (details on p. 138). | <p>Unknown:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The impacts of the existing library on the local economy have not been determined. It is unknown if maintaining the existing library would advance significant and direct improvements to the local economy. There are current limitations surrounding the existing library to attract or support new businesses, as the adjacent sites are primarily used for public services (i.e. City Hall, Civic Square East, transit hub). |
| Asset Management | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to be a quality-built, 50-year asset that allows for scalability and flexibility (i.e. if changes are required in the future). | <p>Needs Improvement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Risk and liability concerns due to building code and safety issues. Built in 1966. The building and its core systems have already exceeded their expected life cycle. While an investment could be made to renovate the existing building and bring it |

| | | |
|------------------------------|---|--|
| | | <p>up to code, it would not meet the desired outcomes of a central library, as outlined by SPL.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL has outgrown its existing downtown location. A renovation would result in less overall space and a smaller collection. |
| Skills and Training | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to enable enhanced educational opportunities with partners, such as READ Saskatoon, SIIT, SK Polytechnic, Usask, School Boards, and home schooling programs. Proposes to support skills and training programs related to: literacy and English as an Additional Language, employment, computer and technology, and STEAM. | <p>Exceeding Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The existing library supports education programming, employment and literacy training, and partnerships. The new library will enhance opportunities to achieve these outcomes. |
| Labour Rights and Employment | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to substantially improve working conditions. For example, the building proposes to address OH&S and Code gaps. Proposes to integrate OH&S into procurement documents related to the construction of the new library and be extended to contractors. | <p>Not Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> OH&S risks exist for the current facility (e.g. insufficient number of washrooms, non-compliant interior fire separations, inadequate building envelope, and hazardous materials (such as asbestos)). |
| Affordability for users | <p>Leading the Way:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes to offer new and enhanced access to free resources, books, technology, media, programming, art, events, etc. | <p>On Track:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Offers free access to books, resources, technology, media, programming, art, events, etc. |

For Further / Future Consideration

- At the time of procurement, SPL proposes to add sustainability-focused outcomes in the scope of their procurement documents and/or requesting that proponents provide information on their business' sustainability mandate and practices.
- There may be opportunities for the City and library to work together to pursue federal funding on behalf of SPL (such as the federal Investing in Canada Infrastructure Program).
- The business case forecasts utility costs for the new facility. A high performance building would likely result in lower utility costs per square foot than the existing building. A more detailed analysis of the anticipated utility and operational costs could be performed once a new building is designed.
- In the future, SPL could calculate/compare the carbon price implications of the proposed energy efficient building to the existing building to show relative cost avoidance or efficiencies.

Other Notes

- The current business case provides a high level financial overview. More detailed costing would be prepared at the design phase.
- SPL has limited opportunity to generate revenue. For example, it cannot charge for services, as per the Libraries Act. The potential ways the new central library could generate revenue through room rentals is outlined in SPL's Functional Program Analysis.
- Refer to SPL's Background: Cost Analysis and Background: Borrowing & Mill-Rate Impact documents for further financial information.

Principle: Good Governance**TBL Outcome - by Principle:**

New Central Library: Exceeding Expectations

Existing Library: Needs Improvement

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

| Indicator | Proposed New Library | Existing Library |
|---|--|---|
| Ethical and Democratic Governance | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Due to the scale, cost, and significance of the proposed central library, SPL has increased oversight, involvement, engagement, and transparency from the Board to the public. The proposed new library is intended to help SPL fulfill their strategic plan, as well as address population growth and increased service demands. | On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL's standard practices meet this indicator. |
| Effective Service Delivery | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposed to support the needs of its patrons, the neighbourhood branches, and the entire library system in Saskatoon. Proposed to be customer-centric in terms of its design and programming. | Meeting Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The following website includes a list of risks of remaining in their existing facility: https://saskatooncentrallibrary.ca/need |
| Education, Communication, Engagement, Capacity Building | Exceeding Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL has conducted community engagement activities through pop-ups, an online survey, stakeholder sessions, employee consultation and a community workshop. Over 2,000 people provided their input and vision for a new central library. Data from community engagement activities informed the functional program. As the project proceeds, there will be ongoing opportunities for the public to participate in the design of the new library. SPL created a new central library project website that provides project information. With the new spaces available in the new library, SPL will have the ability to expand their partnerships and strengthen offerings to their partners. | On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Current communications and engagement efforts provide information on both the existing central library as well as the proposed new central library. |
| Monitoring, Reporting and Compliance | Meeting Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposes that a new central library will meet regulations and building code. Maintaining and monitoring appropriate data, metrics, and records is included in SPL's project charter. SPL intends to use project management best practices and will bring in external resources to support them in this area. | Not Meeting Expectations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> In terms of compliance, the existing building has identified National Building and Fire Code deficiencies. |

| | | |
|-------------------------------------|---|---|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> To plan for the future and to test functionality, SPL has begun trialing spaces, furniture, and finishes in their neighbourhood branch renovations for the new central library. SPL drew on research and best practices when establishing their functional program (e.g. the business case is based on research by KPMG, which included library trends from multiple jurisdictions). | |
| Agility and Adaptiveness | <p>Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The project has an extensive contingency in order to leave room for unknowns and bring the project in on budget. The new library—due to enhanced spaces, facilities, and resources—proposes to enable SPL to implement new ideas and remain responsive to meet community needs. | <p>Not Meeting Expectations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL has attempted to adapt the current facility to their needs; however, there are limitations that exist with the current building. |
| Roles, Responsibilities and Rewards | <p>On Track:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL will continue to encourage and support sustainability, reconciliation, and OH&S as part of everyone’s job. | <p>On Track:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SPL encourages sustainability, reconciliation, and OH&S as part of everyone’s job. |

For Further / Future Consideration

- The business case provided an in-depth post-approval risk analysis. A robust risk mitigation and management plan will be developed upon project approval.