

Fairness Report to City of Saskatoon

Evaluation of Proposals Submitted for Redevelopment of 321 Avenue C North
(Former Saskatoon Transit Site)



Orbis Risk Consulting
203-1327A Wellington St. W.
Ottawa, Ontario, K1Y 3B6

Date: March 22, 2022

March 22, 2022

Mr. Brad Murray
Land Development Project Manager
Saskatoon Land
City Hall, 222 3rd Avenue North
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, S7K 0J5

Re: Fairness Monitor Report – Evaluation of Proposals Submitted for Redevelopment of 321 Avenue C North (Former Saskatoon Transit Site)

Introduction

Orbis Risk Consulting (“Orbis”) was appointed by the City of Saskatoon (“the City”) as Fairness Monitor to oversee the evaluation of proposals submitted for the redevelopment of 321 Avenue C North (Former Saskatoon Transit Site), and to ensure the evaluation was conducted in accordance with the evaluation criteria supplied to prospective proponents and evaluation team members.

As Fairness Monitor, we are an independent and impartial third party whose role is to observe and monitor the procurement process to ensure the openness, fairness, consistency and transparency of the process. The procurement process includes communication, evaluation and decision-making associated with the project.

Limitations and Disclosure

We have limited the scope of our work to documents provided by the City and are not providing an opinion on the accuracy of the information contained within. In addition, Orbis was not involved with the development or review of the project’s scope or in the competitively procured tenders.

We do not assume any responsibility or liability for losses incurred by any parties as a result of our work. We reserve the right (but will be under no obligation) to review all information included or referred to in this Fairness Opinion and, if we consider necessary, to revise same in light of any facts which become known to us subsequent to the date of presentation of same.

Procurement Process

The procurement process was comprised of the following steps:

- Development of the proposal submission package, including detailed project requirement and specifications, evaluation criteria, evaluation process and weightings.
- Issuance of the proposal submission package on Saskatoon Land’s website.

- Establishment of the Evaluation Committee.
- Providing guidance to the Evaluation Team on the evaluation process.
- Evaluation of the proposal submission package responses received by two proponents.
- Negotiation with the top-ranked proponent.

Fairness Monitoring Principles

The following are the fairness monitoring principles that have been applied in our approach to fairness monitoring of the evaluation process:

- The evaluation criteria and evaluation process are established prior to the evaluation of submissions.
- The evaluation criteria, proposal submission package and evaluation processes are internally consistent.
- The pre-established evaluation criteria and evaluation process are followed.
- The evaluation criteria and evaluation process are consistently applied to all submissions.

Scope of Review

In preparing our fairness opinion, we have reviewed, and where applicable, relied upon, the following information and documents:

- City of Saskatoon Corporate Purchasing Policy.
- Proposal submission package – Redevelopment of 321 Avenue C North (Former Saskatoon Transit Site).
- Proposal Evaluation Plan.
- Evaluation team member signed non-disclosure and conflict of interest declarations.
- Final evaluation scoring containing scoring of the rated evaluation criteria.
- Memorandum inviting highest ranked proponent to enter into negotiations for the redevelopment project located at 321 Avenue C North.

It is important to note that Orbis was engaged subsequent to the development and issuance of the proposal submission package. As such, the scope of the review was specific to the evaluation of responses submitted.

Fairness Approach

Our role as Fairness Monitor consisted of observing and monitoring the evaluation process utilized by the City in order to ensure the openness, fairness, consistency and transparency of the communication, evaluation and decision-making processes. Specifically, our responsibilities were to:

- Meet with the City's project manager and evaluation team facilitator to discuss the project.

- Review the Evaluation Process Plan to ensure consistency and fairness with the proposal submission package.
- Monitor correspondence related to any questions Evaluation Committee members or Proponents may raise.
- Attend proposal submission package evaluation sessions with Evaluation Committee.
- Provide advice on fairness matters that may arise throughout the process.
- Prepare fairness monitor report.

Fairness Conclusion

Based on the information and documents reviewed, meetings attended and discussions with the Evaluation team and Project Manager, the evaluation process was conducted in a fair and open manner and in accordance with applicable policies and the evaluation process, methodology, criteria, scoring and weighting within the proposal submission package.

Sincerely,



Fairness Monitor
Clinton Griffiths, CPA, CA, CIA, CISA, CDMP, CRM
Director, Orbis Risk Consulting