

City of Edmonton Reimagine Service Actions				
From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Name	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Parks and Open Spaces				
Parking Fees	The City will implement paid parking at Emily Murphy Park, Rafter's Landing, Muttart Conservatory, Fort Edmonton Park and TELUS World of Science in spring 2022. Additionally, Hawrelak Park will be considered for paid parking once the major rehabilitation is completed, at the earliest 2026. This action will be connected to the City's broader strategic Public Parking Action Plan, which will be before Council spring 2022. NOTE: This Item did not advance to Council, but was part of the initial strategy.	The estimated potential net revenue for the City of charging for parking at the identified lots could exceed \$1.6 million over five years. This estimate is net of initial implementation costs associated with outfitting the parking lots with ePark machines, signage and other supporting infrastructure, and net of ongoing operating and maintenance costs.	The one similar area where the City does have paid parking, is at River Landing but not at any other river bank parks or other parks throughout the city. A review of potential high use facilities and a high level cost analysis could be undertaken on this if Council direction is provided.	Council Direction would be required to investigate this further.
Maintained Park Space	The City will invest in a new naturalization strategy and implementation plan to replace the current plan that was created in 1994. Future cost savings will be realized after the new strategy is developed. Additionally, the City will pursue passive naturalization of 80 hectares per year. This work will be supported by a more comprehensive engagement and education action plan.	It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver years and potential cumulative annual savings of approximately \$0.3 to \$1.3 million over five years and potential annual savings of approximately \$0.3 to \$ 0.8 million by year five. However, it is estimated to cost \$500,000 up front to realize this strategy.	Actions related to potential expansion of the City's Park Naturalization Program are included in the Green Infrastructure Implementation Plan and Water Conservation Strategy. Early research from the Water Conservation Strategy indicates that a conversion of irrigated turf to naturalized grassland could result in significant water savings, with resulting reductions in costs and GHG emissions associated with irrigation. Additionally, the Green Infrastructure Implementation Plan identifies actions and initiatives for the expansion of the existing Naturalized Park program, as well as opportunities to naturalize non-park green spaces. Some early work is already taking place, including the proposed naturalized landscaping at the Dundonald Solar Farm.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Recreational and Sport Facility Access				
Registered Programs	The City will reduce the amount of registered recreation and culture programming that it delivers. Specifically: (a) Reduce the number of course offerings and/or eliminate some registered programs where costs are not being recovered by registration fees; and (b) Explore the delivery of certain registered programs using third-party providers at a lower cost, on behalf of the City.	It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver potential cumulative savings between \$0.9 - \$1.8 million over five years and annual savings of approximately \$0.2 to \$0.4 million by Year 5. The range of potential savings may be influenced by the total amount of low margin programming reduced by the City. The high range considers all relevant low margin programming to be reduced, while the low case considers programs that recover at least 50% of their costs.	The City's programming team reviews all program offerings and participation rates regularly. New programs are offered on a trial basis and reviewed for uptake and considered from long term offering. The City conducts user surveys to determine satisfaction levels and any program adjustments. Each of the registered programs have a targeted cost recovery objective, where adult registered programs are set to recover 100% of costs, and youth programming is set to recover 85% of costs. We could conduct a further review if Council is interested in exploring different approaches.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.

From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Recreational and Sport Facility Access	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Service Delivery Contracting	The review looked at facility access, operations and programming to determine if there are benefits to contracting third party service providers, associations, or community partners. It looked at smaller, single purpose facilities such as arenas, leisure centres, senior centres. The City will not advance outsourcing single-purpose recreation facilities at this time but instead review current programming and operating models to improve financial performance. This may result in a reduction in the amount of subsidized rental time and programs available. Increased fees and increased use of third party program providers will also be under consideration.	Outsourcing operations and programming at select facilities could deliver overall cost savings to the City while maintaining service levels. The types of single-purpose facilities deemed viable in this analysis were predominantly arenas. Review of the data provided by the City as part of this opportunity suggests that eight facilities could benefit from using third-party operators. It is also estimated that outsourcing the operations of eight single-purpose facilities could potentially result in cumulative cost savings of approximately \$0.4 to \$2.3 million over five years and potential annual savings of approximately \$0.1 to \$0.5 million by year five.	The City has leased out the operations of the Gordie Howe Sports Complex to a third party that includes several facilities and receives funding support from the City. To date, we have not done this with Leisure Centers and Arenas. The City is currently exploring a partnership with the YMCA on the operation of a future Leisure Facility. Of note in this area, the City has had a long standing tradition of neighbourhood based program delivery through small grants to Community Associations who deliver the programs. Further the City has a long history of partnering with community based organizations in the construction and operation of sport and recreation facilities, such as Optimist Hill Park, the Soccer Centres, the Riverside Badminton and Tennis Club, the Victoria Park Boat House, to name a few.	Council Direction would be required to investigate this further.
Golf Course Operations	Cost recoveries from the City's three golf courses (Riverside, Victoria and Rundle Park golf courses) have declined from 2015 to 2019. The business case assessed the viability of leasing the golf courses and driving range to a private operator. The City would retain all ownership of the courses, facilities, land and capital assets and the courses would remain fully public. An Expression of Interest (EOI) will be developed in 2022 to assess private sector interest in entering into a leasing agreement with the City for Riverside, Rundle Park and Victoria Golf Courses with an aim for better cost recovery to the City.	Estimates suggest that it may be possible to for the City to generate approximately \$0.3 to \$0.5 million per year (total for all three courses) in rent. It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver a potential cumulative financial benefit between \$1.0 to \$1.5 million over five years.	The City of Saskatoon Golf Courses operate at 100% cost recovery including contributions to dedicated reserves, for capital expenditures, and golf course upgrades. In the past 15 plus years, City Golf Courses have not experienced the financial difficulties experienced in some other municipalities. Of note there currently an overhead amount charged to Golf Course Operations budget based on 7.5% of Holiday Park's operating expenses - \$121,200 in 2022. This came out of an earlier audit recommendation that identified that Golf should be paying the City a ROI.	Council Direction would be required to investigate this further.
Service Delivery	The Community and Recreation Facilities branch is modernizing how it plans, assesses and delivers some recreation services. This includes automating many processes, including how customer data is analyzed and providing more online customer service. Administration is planning a hybrid model of customer services at City recreation facilities introducing self-service payment kiosks. Administration anticipates this new approach will offer a more streamlined customer experience and reduce workforce costs.	Potential cost savings will be identified after the review of current NFP leases is complete. However, preliminary estimates suggest savings of \$1.8 million over five years.	The City over the years has added some on-line and self serve options, such as: Leisure on line for all program information and registrations, Drop-in on line for real time information about drop in programs at the Leisure Centres; the reduction in the printing and elimination of the delivery of the Leisure Guide has saved costs; and the LeisureCard pass scan for entrance to the Leisure Centres makes entrance to the facilities a more streamlined process for LeisureCard holders. Administration also continues to explore more options for expanding our online services related to recreation facilities including upgrading our online registration tools.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Facility Management and Maintenance				
Facility Maintenance Functions	This review explored whether more centralized maintenance functions across business areas could produce cost savings and efficiencies. The feasibility of a more centralized approach will be revisited at the end of 2022 to better align with future regional agreements with the Edmonton Metropolitan Transit Services Commission.	Based on the analysis completed, the City should consider centralizing ETS' LRT facility maintenance function into FMS. This could result in reduced managerial, coordination and administration Full Time Equivalent positions (FTEs). It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver potential cumulative savings between \$0.7 to \$2.4 million over five years and potential annual savings of approximately \$0.1 to \$0.5 million by year 5. More recent analysis suggests that savings of \$1.2 million could result by year five.	Saskatoon Transit Maintenance and Operations for fixed route services is already centralized at COC. The majority of the City's facilities are managed centrally through the Facilities Management department. The recently developed Facilities Asset Management Plan provides a comprehensive strategy to streamline maintenance and rehabilitation activities.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.

From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Facility Management and Maintenance	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Fabrication Shop	The City's fabrication program provides development and repair work for the City's fleet of vehicles and other fabrication projects across the City. The fabrication shop is not the sole provider to the City for these services. The review examined the financial cost of the fabrication program, including multiple options related to service level changes, potential levels of outsourcing and impacts to overall financial viability. Welding and fabrication services will continue at the City as it is a service that recovers costs and provides a net positive financial return.	Based on analysis of the potential options and the revised financial data provided by the City, the City should continue to operate the Fab Shop in its current format, with improved financial reporting and ongoing validation of its price competitiveness. There appears to be no additional financial benefit to the City associated with this opportunity.	Fleet Services' current welding/fabrication shop is a smaller scale operation which consists of two bays with three welders. These three employees support the Fleet Services shop as well as the operational groups such as WWO when they request assistance. Fleet has a mobile welding truck that allows for work to be done in the field such as welding water mains, performing welding work at the landfill etc. Fleet does not outsource any welding/fabrication work. Current resources meet Fleet Services demands and provide support to other groups as well. when requested. The implementation of the Asset Management component of the Fusion initiative will enable further reporting and controls regarding efficiency corporate-wide, including this area.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Lifecycle Replacement	This review looked at the benefit of a lifecycle framework to guide decision making about the replacement of the City's approximately 5,100 vehicles and pieces of equipment. The City will develop a Lifecycle Replacement Strategy in tandem with the "Optimize Overall Fleet Size" action. The framework will be implemented in 2022 and is designed to decrease costs related to fleet purchases.	Based on analysis of the current and potential new approach, the City should consider changing how its fleet replacement decisions are made through the implementation of a lifecycle approach with condition-based monitoring. It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver potential cumulative savings of \$2.3 million over five years and potential annual savings of approximately \$0.5 million by year five.	Fleet Services is a member of the Canadian Association of Municipal Fleet Managers and has two management team members with Certified Public Fleet Professional designations through the APWA. Based on the professional fleet management principles and guidelines, Fleet Services follows industry best practices in regards to fleet management which includes equipment and vehicle lifecycles. Fleet has also implemented an Asset Management Plan which is reviewed annually and takes into consideration items such as current status, condition, age, etc. Fleet also looks at utilization to determine if units are truly required. As a recent example, some user groups were approached last year and as a result of the needs assessment, fleet size was reduced by five units. High level steps that Fleet Services follows are: 1. unit is procured (through RFP, RFQ etc.) 2. unit is delivered by vendor 3. unit is put into service (entered into Fleet Management System, assigned a lifecycle, etc.) 4. unit is managed through its service life (PM schedules, repairs, utilization verified etc.) 5. near the end of the lifecycle, items such as age, meter reading, unit condition are assessed to verify if early replacement is required or if the lifecycle could be extended 6. when the time comes to procure a replacement unit, Fleet has discussions with the user group to verify if the unit is truly required, if it's the right size, if an EV option is available etc.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.

From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Facility Management and Maintenance	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Optimize Fleet Size	While the City of Edmonton has a similar number of assets per capita of other Canadian cities, the initial review noted that there may be opportunity to further optimize the fleet size. The City will develop a governance structure and decision-making framework to ensure a consistent, City-wide approach to determine levels of spare vehicles. This work will be done at the same time as the development of the "Fleet Lifecycle Replacement Strategy". This framework will be completed for implementation in 2022 and is designed to decrease costs related to fleet purchases.	Based on the analysis completed, the City should consider changing how decisions are made regarding the addition of fleet assets. Specific changes for the City to consider includes a new decision-making model that encourages a consistent, Citywide approach to: – Determining the levels of spares; – Making rent versus own decisions; and – Identifying opportunities to share spares of a common type across City departments. It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver potential cumulative savings between \$0.6 to \$0.7 million over five years and potential annual savings of approximately \$0.1 million by year five.	Although each operational group requests equipment and vehicles that they require, it is Fleet Services that provides consistency across the corporation by verifying fleet right sizing, proper utilization, etc. When considering vehicle and equipment needs as part of the procurement decisions, Fleet Services takes into consideration factors such as the operational group requirements, risk of having/not having enough spares, available funding etc. Fleet Services has used a rent vs. lease vs. own analysis to aid in making decisions. Decisions on the number of spares are based on the service level agreements with various user groups (Police, Solid Waste etc.). These agreements stipulate how many spares are required to maintain mandated levels of service when units are in the shop being repaired or inspected. Rent vs. own decisions are made on an ongoing basis based on the type of vehicle and options available. A number of units that were previously owned are now rented every season so that they don't sit idle for the portion of the season when they are not needed. Units that are difficult to rent or are very expensive to rent are typically owned. Identification of opportunities to share spares of a common type across City departments was attempted in the past (Parks/Roadways), however it created some operational challenges that made it difficult to deliver operational programs throughout the season.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Reduce Mileage Reimbursement	The review explored the opportunity to align the private vehicle mileage reimbursement rate to other public sector comparators in Alberta for staff using personal vehicles. The City will consider reducing the private vehicle mileage rate for staff to better align with public sector comparators for Alberta. If approved, Policy A1206 - Administrative Procedures - Private Vehicle Reimbursement will be adjusted to reflect the rate change. Work is underway on this action.	The City of Edmonton estimates it would save \$157,000 per year or \$788,000 over five years. However, this is subject to additional analysis.	The City's Travel Policy has recently been updated to provide a vehicle reimbursement equivalent to the Canada Revenue Agency maximum allowance reimbursement rate (\$0.55/km). The 2018 Service, Savings and Sustainability report stated that approx. \$280,000 was saved through this work to better align reimbursement rates and criteria with industry best practice. This impacts City staff without Car Allowance written into their Collective Bargaining Agreement. CUPE 59 is the remaining area where improvement could be made, and the Admin will continue to take steps to reduce costs.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Supply Services				
Vendor Managed/Consignment parts inventory system for Fleet Management and Maintenance	Enhancing the Vendor-Managed Inventory (VMI) / consignment system for fleet by introducing a consignment model to reduce the carrying costs of inventory. The City will expand its use of VMI/Consignment approaches to include parts inventory for both transit and municipal fleet with key vendors who have expressed interest.	It is estimated that this opportunity could deliver potential cumulative savings between \$0.9 million and \$1.6 million over five years, and potential annual savings of approximately \$190 to \$330 thousand by year five. Based on a potential reduction in inventory, the City could anticipate a potential one-time cashflow benefit of between \$2.5 million and \$4 million in addition to the projected savings.	Currently Fleet Services does not use Vendor Managed Inventory or Consignment models. Supply Chain Management group may be exploring these models and solutions such as vending machines for consumables. All of Fleet Services inventory is currently owned.	Council Direction would be required to investigate this further.

From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Supply Services	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Review Non-Profit Lease and Facility Arrangements to Improve Cost Recovery	There is an opportunity for the City to either reduce the space provided to non-for-profits (NFP) or to increase recoveries on existing leases (For example, for rent, utilities, maintenance costs, capital investment). Approximately 55% of the NFP leases will expire by the end of 2023. Administration will review NFP leasing practices to determine where changes might be implemented to improve cost recovery.		Administration is currently in the process of preparing a report outlining the City's approach to service group facility rentals and leases. This report is in response to a Council resolution and is expected to be presented by the end of 2022.	Administration will report back regarding this initiative.
Fire Rescue Services				
Pre-Hospital Medical Care	Administration will continue to provide pre-hospital medical care at the First Medical Responder level. There is a benefit of having fire services support emergency medical response, at its current level, as shown by the response to the opioid crisis. Administration is not considering increasing the scope of practice for pre-hospital medical care at this time because it would introduce significant new expenses that could not be absorbed into the current budget.	Reducing the scope of medical calls does not create savings in the form of reduced staff or deployed units. Instead, the primary benefit is in terms of increased capacity for the service via reduced pressure on demand for firefighter deployment.	SFD is part of a coordinated and integrated inter-agency program to enhance the delivery of pre-hospital emergency medical services. SFD currently provides pre-hospital care at the Primary Care Paramedic (PCP) level, responding to emergent medical calls determined by protocols within the program. SFD does not generally respond to non-urgent medical calls. SFD PCP's are able to deliver a number of front line medications within their scope of practice such as epinephrine, Narcan, glucose, Dextrose, ventilated salbutamol, & pentrox. SFD paramedics also perform advanced airway control. SFD paramedics are able to deliver these medical interventions in "hot zone" areas that other responders are not able to. SFD PCP's also perform a wide variety of community-based medical services such as vaccination and testing.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.
Response to Medical Calls	Pre-hospital medical care is a voluntary partnership that now makes up almost 70 percent of the calls responded to by Edmonton Fire Rescue Services (EFRS) and medical call volume is growing 3.5 times faster than non-medical calls. In addition, 24 percent of the pre-hospital medical calls are non-urgent calls where EFRS is not required to respond. EFRS, working closely with Alberta Health Services (AHS), will explore opportunities to divert some activities related to non-urgent medical calls. A more detailed assessment is required before a change of this scope is adopted.	See above as the results are applied to both services.	Although Saskatoon has seen a significant increase in total calls for service in recent years (+21% in 2021) we have not seen the disproportionate increase in medical response call volume that Edmonton Fire is experiencing. EMS volume increased by 19% in 2021 and remained at approximately 42% of total calls for service. Edmonton reports that 24% of their EMS response was non-urgent calls. SFD non-urgent (code green) EMS was 2.3% of our EMS calls and 1% of total calls for service. SFD does not currently respond to Alpha or Bravo calls. In short, SFD is not experiencing the same stress caused by a disproportionate growth in EMS calls for service as Edmonton.	Not Applicable.

From Edmonton Reporting			Saskatoon Comments	
Fire Rescue Services	Description & Actions	Potential Expenditure Reductions or Revenue Gains	City of Saskatoon Administration Comments	Next Steps
Medical Response Units	The business case explored if efficiencies might be realized without compromising the safety of citizens or staff by replacing two recently added pumper trucks to the downtown with smaller units and reduced staff to respond to medical calls. The medical specific response units would consist of a sport utility vehicle or similar vehicle, staffed by two or three firefighters and equipped with medical supplies necessary to support the current First Medical Responder level of pre-hospital medical care. A two-year pilot will be pursued in 2022 and 2023. While this pilot is active, the projected annual savings will be reallocated towards priority initiatives such as enhanced outreach, mental wellness, training and development within EFRS.	Two new Medical Response Units would be an estimated investment of \$130,000 in fleet. The City has estimated that it would cost up to \$65,000 to acquire and outfit a new vehicle for use as a Medical Response Unit. This is based on a new SUV plus the cost of adding lights, sirens, and the medical equipment that is available on a pumper truck. Savings can be calculated as follows, assuming that EFRS reduces firefighter positions to capture the savings of the smaller crew: – Reduction of two staff per crew, on two crews, which equates to 20 fewer FTE required overall.39 – The reductions in personnel are estimated to save approximately \$1.93 million per year, or \$160,000 per month. – Based on the savings from fewer personnel, the City could recover the cost of adding both new Medical Response Unit vehicles in less than a month.	The practise of replacing one current Engine company staffed with 5 firefighters by a single Medical response unit staffed with 3 firefighters is only available in fire response districts that have more than one engine company. Stations No. 1 & No. 2, which receive approximately 50% of our total calls for service, are the only 2 (out of 9) stations that have more than 1 engine. SFD has plans to relocate the second engine in Station No. 2 to provide response coverage into out of range regions in the Western part of Saskatoon, leaving Station 2 with only one Engine. Station 1 currently staffs 3 Engines to provide service to the core area, however, one of the engines is very regularly out of commission for low staffing levels, leaving Station No. 1 with two engine companies. Reducing Station No. 1 to 1 Engine on a regular basis would compromise the ability to provide an effective and safe level of service for all types of calls. All but one of SFD fire crews are cross-staffed with secondary apparatus/functions. These specialty crews operate as four person teams such as Hazardous Materials teams, Technical Rescue Teams, Water Response Teams, and Wildland Firefighting teams. This function would not be possible if the current companies were broken into smaller units that were unable to respond as one unit. SFD has explored this model in the past and supports further exploration of medical response units. SFD would benefit from an integrated model approach as a provider of all hazard response.	Council Direction would be required to investigate this further.
EFRS Captial Investment	Capital costs for acquiring land, design, construction and new heavy vehicles is approximately \$18 million. The addition of a new station and new crews also carries an ongoing operational cost increase. This business case explored how capital investment decisions are made. Administration will establish criteria to guide capital investments for new stations and heavy vehicles. This will help to determine when a new station or heavy fleet is required.	No specific savings were identified, but instead it recommends using specific criteria to determine new station and equipment investments. The analysis proposed using factors such as construction, risk, land use, response level, growth.	SFD analyzes incident data, GIS mapping, and response performance data and incident data to examine our deployment model. Service level objective deficiencies are noted, analyzed and prioritized. Options are explored including redeployment of current resources or increasing resources as needed aligning with the City's Growth Plan. Most recently SFD has relocated two stations (1 in progress) to provide needed response coverage without adding additional resources. Service level deficiencies have been identified as a priority in two areas of the western portion of the city. SFD has developed a plan to address the deficiencies with both new resources and redeployment of current resources. As Saskatoon continues to grow through both infill densification and new greenfield development, SFD will continue to monitor the data to ensure the optimum resource deployment to meet our service level objectives as efficiently as possible while maintaining safety for the residents and emergency responders.	Initiative already underway in Saskatoon Council direction would be required for more information or to alter our current path.