

## Triple Bottom Line Assessment – Boulevard Gardening Program

### Process and Methodology

The Administration used the City of Saskatoon's *Triple Bottom Line (TBL) Decision Making Tool* to comply with *Council Policy C08-001 – Triple Bottom Line*.

When conducting a TBL analysis, it is appropriate to compare and/or evaluate multiple options. As such, the following options were reviewed:

- Option 1 – Maintain current boulevard program scope and funding;
- Option 2 – Expand program to include centre medians and a centre median application process; or
- Option 3 – Expand program as described in Option 2, with the addition of a fee for centre median applications.

In conducting the analysis, the Administration relied on the expertise of the Project Team and Subject Matter Experts from the Parks, Roadways, Engagement, and Sustainability Departments. Best practice research and results from public engagement were also considered in the assessment.

This review intended as a high-level assessment to identify the initiative's environmental, social, economic, and governance outcomes, as well as to identify opportunities to achieve even greater sustainability benefits. The results are intended to support ongoing decision making, rather than be relied upon as a fixed sustainability evaluation.

### Caveats and Limitations

Some TBL areas were considered out of scope, including items that were not contingent on and/or influenced by the initiative: Renewable Energy, Sustainable Transportation, Self Sufficiency and Living with Dignity, Innovation, Sustainable Procurement, Roles Responsibilities and Rewards.

The following external factors impacted the initiative's ability to achieve higher TBL outcomes in certain areas:

- Separate boulevards may be used to store snow during winters with high snowfall such as 2020-21. Boulevard gardens may be damaged by snow removal processes, and materials left on the boulevard may in turn damage snow removal equipment. It is unknown to what extent this will be a risk in future years.
- Certain Fusion processes related to monitoring and tracking program compliance are still being refined by the Administration. It is anticipated that as Fusion is implemented, tracking and monitoring processes will be refined.
- Social distancing measures caused by COVID-19 impacted the engagement methods used during public engagement. While the public engagement campaign was well received overall, workshops and stakeholder meetings were not possible to the degree they would be during a regular year.

## Results and Findings

Overall, the results of Administration’s TBL review indicates that:

- Options 1, 2, and 3 are meeting expectations for the Environmental Health and Integrity indicators.
- Options 1 and 2 are meeting expectations for the Social Equity and Cultural Wellbeing indicators. Option 3 is on track.
- Option 1 is meeting expectations for the Economic Prosperity and Fiscal Responsibility indicators. Options 2 and 3 are on track.
- Options 1, 2, and 3 are on track for the Good Governance indicators.

A summary of results for each TBL principle and indicator are included in the subsequent sections of this document. To provide context, a numerical description of the outcomes is shown in the following table:

TBL Score	TBL Outcome
Below 0%	Not meeting expectations
0-19%	Needs improvement
20-39%	On track
40-59%	Meeting expectations
60-79%	Exceeding expectations
Above 80%	Leading the way

## Summary of areas for further/future consideration

<b>Content of the Guidelines</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Rain gardens:</b> These were not included in this iteration of the Guidelines but may be a future consideration to improve storm water outcomes.</li> <li>• <b>Native Species:</b> Opportunities to support residents in planting native species and expand the program to other rights-of-way will be considered in future.</li> </ul>
<b>Communications and Education</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Soil contaminants:</b> Potential soil contaminants are a risk for boulevard gardeners producing food in their boulevard. More work is needed to understand where soil contaminants exist, and to support residents in identifying the risk of contaminants in their gardens.</li> <li>• <b>Program equity:</b> There will always be opportunities to ensure that the Guidelines and overall program are accessible and enjoyable to all residents regardless of age, gender, ability, income, culture, or race. This is an area for continuous improvement of the program.</li> <li>• <b>Partnerships:</b> Partnership opportunities should be actively explored in future, including partnerships with Community Associations, Business Improvement Districts, the University of Saskatchewan, and Healthy Yards partners.</li> <li>• <b>Funding:</b> External funding opportunities should be actively sought after.</li> </ul>
<b>Safety and Garden Damage</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Risks to gardeners:</b> Working in rights-of-ways can pose a safety risk to residents. This risk is considered low on local streets with low speed limits. But these risks should be continually monitored, and</li> </ul>

	<p>opportunities to reduce the risk should be considered. For example, a regular newsletter with safety tips and information about upcoming road work could be sent to gardeners.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Risks to workers:</b> The presence of gardens in rights-of-way may pose a low risk to workers who need to navigate around garden materials, structures, and equipment. This risk should be actively tracked by the program going forward and mitigated wherever possible.</li> <li>• <b>Snow removal:</b> It is currently unknown to what degree boulevard gardens will impact, and be impacted by, snow removal processes. During years with high snowfall such as 2020-21, separate boulevards are used for snow storage. Monitoring any associated risks related to service or utility disruptions should be an area for continuous improvement in the program.</li> </ul>
<p><b>Continuous Improvement</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>Program Administration:</b> Project leads will need to communicate regularly with other departments (e.g. customer care centre, Roadways, Parks, Bylaw, etc.) and residents to track Guideline compliance, review bylaw or resident complaints, inform gardeners of upcoming road work when possible, and inform various staff about garden locations. Many processes related to tracking and monitoring are currently being updated during Fusion, so the exact mechanism through which these criteria will be tracked is currently unknown.</li> <li>• <b>Tracking garden locations, inquiries, and complaints:</b> New garden locations need to be shared with other staff such as Parks and Roadways. Garden related complaints and inquiries should be actively tracked and coordinated by the Administration going forward. Coordination with other work groups such as Roadway Operations, Utilities, Bylaw Enforcement, Parks, and the Customer Care Centre will be needed. Regular reporting of inquiries, incidents, and complaints is recommended, including regular updates to the corporate Knowledge Base.</li> </ul>

**Principle: Environmental Health and Integrity**

**TBL Outcome – By Principle:**

- Option 1: Meeting expectations (40-59%)
- Option 2: Meeting expectations (40-59%)
- Option 3: Meeting expectations (40-59%)

**TBL Outcomes – by Indicator:**

Indicator	Option 1: Maintain current boulevard program scope and funding	Option 2: Expand program to include centre medians and a centre median application process	Option 3: Expand program as described in Option 2, with the addition of a fee for centre median applications
Conservation of Resources	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program will encourage xeriscaping and low water use in education materials.</li> </ul>		
Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program will lead to modest improvements in soil carbon sequestration and reduce the urban heat island effect.</li> </ul>		
Green Buildings and Sustainable Land Use	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program supports infill and density by providing more green space to residents with small or shaded yards</li> </ul>		
Healthy Ecosystems	<p><b>Meeting expectations</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program will enhance green space through gardening and support biodiversity by encouraging native species.</li> <li>Gardening may help provide dust suppression and a buffer between traffic and pedestrians</li> </ul>	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program will enhance green space through gardening and support biodiversity by encouraging native species.</li> <li>Gardening may help provide dust suppression and a buffer between traffic and pedestrians. Expanding the program to additional spaces will expand these benefits to more spaces</li> </ul>	
Clean Air, Water, and Land	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Encouraging salt and drought tolerant plants, chemical free gardening, and other healthy yard practices in education materials could help mitigate poor soil conditions on boulevards</li> </ul>	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Encouraging salt and drought tolerant plants, chemical free gardening, and other healthy yard practices in education materials could help mitigate poor soil conditions on boulevards.</li> <li>An expanded program will support the responsible management of vacant or underutilized spaces by encouraging citizens to make the best use of these spaces.</li> </ul>	

Waste Reduction and Diversion	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Program will encourage the use of city compost and mulch to amend garden soil</li> </ul>
Storm Water Management	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Modest improvements through better soil conditions that will indirectly lead to improved quality of storm water</li> </ul>
Sustainable Food System	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <p>Food production will be encouraged. While the quantity of food grown on a boulevard is not significant, the program will lead to greater benefits through overall education and promotion of healthy yard practices.</p>

**For further/future consideration:**

- Rain gardens were not included in this iteration of the Guidelines but will be a future consideration to improve storm water outcomes.
- Potential soil contaminants are a risk for boulevard gardeners producing food in their boulevard. More work is needed to understand where soil contaminants exist, and to support residents in identifying the risk of contaminants in their gardens.

**Principle: Social Equity and Cultural Wellbeing**

**TBL Outcome – By Principle:**

- Option 1: Meeting expectations (40-59%)
- Option 2: Meeting expectations (40-59%)
- Option 3: On track (20-39%)

**TBL Outcomes – by Indicator:**

Indicator	Option 1: Maintain current boulevard program scope and funding	Option 2: Expand program to include centre medians and a centre median application process	Option 3: Expand program as described in Option 2, with the addition of a fee for centre median applications
Equity and Opportunity	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There is no charge for the base program.</li> <li>Program materials use plain language and include accessibility criteria.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>There will be no charge for the expanded program.</li> <li>Program materials use plain language and include accessibility criteria where possible.</li> <li>Expanding the Guidelines to new areas will make the program accessible to more residents</li> </ul>	<p><b>Needs improvement:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The fee for the expanded program will make the program less accessible.</li> <li>Program materials use plain language and include accessibility criteria where possible. Expanding the Guidelines to new areas will make the program accessible to more residents</li> </ul>

Diversity and Inclusion	<b>On track:</b>	
Heritage, Arts, and Culture	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program provides increased opportunity for residents to meet their neighbors, learn from one another, and build community</li> </ul>	
Health and Wellbeing	<b>On track:</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program will provide a modest opportunity to support or restore cultural heritage by encouraging and supporting culturally significant and native plant species.</li> </ul>	
	<b>Meeting expectations:</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program supports a higher quality of life for all by creating more welcoming streetscapes and providing gardening opportunities close to home.</li> <li>The program encourages residents to spend more time outside and interact with their neighbours.</li> </ul>	
Safety and Resiliency	<b>Needs improvement:</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Working in the right-of-way does pose a low risk to personal safety. Options to mitigate these risks have been integrated into the program.</li> <li>The program development incorporated CPTED principles.</li> <li>Raised beds left on rights-of-way over the winter may cause service disruptions to roadway clearing. Boulevards are occasionally needed for snow storage. It is currently unknown to what degree high snowfall will impact the program.</li> </ul>	
Civic Participation	<b>Meeting expectations:</b>	<b>Exceeding Expectations:</b>
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program provides opportunities for residents to be engaged with public spaces near their homes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program provides opportunities for residents to be engaged with public spaces in additional locations.</li> </ul> <p>The Administration will partner with Healthy Yards organizations such as the University of Saskatchewan, and community associations, to offer additional supports for residents to increase participation rates.</p>
Recreation	<b>Exceeding expectations:</b>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The program supports passive recreation through gardening.</li> <li>The program supports an attractive, vibrant, and lively city through the use of public land for gardening.</li> </ul>	

**For further/future consideration:**

- There will always be opportunities to ensure that the Guidelines and overall program are accessible and enjoyable to all residents regardless of age, gender, ability, income, culture, or race. This is an area for continuous improvement of the program.
- Partnership opportunities to encourage program participation should be actively explored in future, including partnerships with Community Associations, Business Improvement Districts, the University of Saskatchewan, and Healthy Yards partners.
- It is currently unknown to what degree boulevard gardens will impact, and be impacted by, snow removal processes. During years with high snowfall such as

2020-21, separate boulevards are used for snow storage. Monitoring any associated risks related to service or utility disruptions should be an area for continuous improvement in the program.

- Working in rights-of-ways can pose a low to moderate safety risk to residents. This risk is considered low on local streets where traffic speed limits are low. But these risks should be continually monitored, and opportunities to reduce the risk should be considered.

**Principle: Economic Prosperity and Fiscal Responsibility**

**TBL Outcome – By Principle:**

- Option 1: Meeting expectations (40-59%)
- Option 2: On track (20-39%)
- Option 3: On track (20-39%)

**TBL Outcomes – by Indicator:**

Indicator	Option 1: Maintain current boulevard program scope and funding	Option 2: Expand program to include centre medians and a centre median application process	Option 3: Expand program as described in Option 2, with the addition of a fee for centre median applications
Financial Planning and Resourcing	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Gardens and site upgrades are paid for by citizens. The financial impact on the City is minimal.</li> <li>• Financial implications to the City include enforcement following complaints, administering the program, and maintenance costs of Roadways and Parks staff. Operational costs will be incorporated into the work plans of existing staff.</li> </ul> <p><b>Needs improvement:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Program would be contingent upon capital investment or external funding.</li> </ul>		
Affordability for Users	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is no fee under these options</li> </ul>		<p><b>Not meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• An administrative fee will make the program inaccessible for some users</li> </ul> <p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is no proposed fee for this option, and additional incentives to offset gardener expenses would be explored.</li> </ul>
Support the Local Economy	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Business Improvement Districts were engaged during the review process.</li> </ul>		

<p>Asset Management</p>	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Boulevard gardens achieve co-benefits of a city-owned asset including food production, biodiversity, and storm water management.</li> <li>• By gardening, residents are improving soil conditions which might not otherwise occur.</li> <li>• Potential risks such as invasive weeds and damage to tree roots are mitigated by criteria in the Guidelines.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Boulevard gardens achieve co-benefits of a city-owned asset including food production, biodiversity, and storm water management.</li> <li>• By gardening, residents are improving soil conditions which might not otherwise occur.</li> <li>• Potential risks such as invasive weeds and damage to tree roots are mitigated by criteria in the Guidelines.</li> </ul> <p>Expansion of the program to other rights-of-way will further extend these benefits, reducing the degradation of existing assets.</p>
<p>Skills and Training</p>	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <p>The program will pursue gardening/horticulture education and training opportunities for volunteers in partnership with the University of Saskatchewan.</p>	
<p>Labour Rights and Employment</p>	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Boulevard gardening issues that may be a concern from an OH&amp;S perspective have been addressed by the updated Guidelines such as added criteria for gardening around trees, granular material being disallowed, and removal of temporary structures and materials.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Needs improvement:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Allowing gardening in additional rights-of-way such as centre medians has the potential to create a risk for workers who need to navigate around garden structures, equipment, and materials. If gardeners follow the Guidelines this risk should be mitigated. However, since this program is new, the exact risk is currently unknown.</li> <li>• Centre median gardens do already exist in the City. The introduction of an application process may mitigate risks to workers. However, this is currently unknown.</li> </ul>

**For further/future consideration:**

- The degree to which garden complaints will change following the adoption of the new program is currently unknown. Garden-related complaints can include complaints about a garden contravening the Guidelines, or a garden being damaged



by City processes such as utility or street maintenance. Garden related complaints and inquiries should be actively tracked and coordinated by the Administration going forward.

- The presence of gardens in rights-of-way may pose a low risk to workers who need to navigate around garden materials, structures, and equipment. This risk should be actively tracked by the program going forward and mitigated wherever possible.
- External funding opportunities should be actively sought after.

**Principle: Good Governance**

**TBL Outcome – By Principle:**

- Option 1: On track (20-39%)
- Option 2: On track (20-39%)
- Option 3: On track (20-39%)

**TBL Outcomes – by Indicator:**

Indicator	Option 1: Maintain current boulevard program scope and funding	Option 2: Expand program to include centre medians and a centre median application process	Option 3: Expand program as described in Option 2, with the addition of a fee for centre median applications
Ethical and Democratic Governance	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clear Guidelines supports accessibility and transparency of City programs.</li> </ul> <p>The Guidelines are a response to various plans and strategies that have not yet been fully implemented such as the Saskatoon Regional Food System Assessment and various Local Area Plans.</p>		
Effective Service Delivery	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Providing a mechanism for citizens to improve assets does improve service delivery.</li> <li>• The program has been developed using public engagement results and has incorporated customer feedback wherever possible</li> </ul>	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Providing a mechanism for citizens to improve assets does improve service delivery.</li> <li>• The program has been developed using public engagement results and has incorporated customer feedback wherever possible.</li> </ul> <p>Through the expansion of the program, there are still some unknowns that will need to be monitored for continuous improvement. These may include informing field staff of garden sites, notifying gardeners of upcoming road work, and notifying residents of a garden being installed in their neighbourhood.</p>	
Education, Communication, Engagement,	<p><b>Meeting expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The public engagement campaign was well received, especially considering the constraints caused by COVID-19.</li> </ul>		

Capacity Building	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Administrative advisory committee was very engaged and included stakeholders from many different departments.</li> <li>Communications and education campaigns are planned to follow the Council report.</li> </ul> <p>The program represents a partnership between the City and community to improve rights-of-way condition.</p>	
Monitoring, Reporting and Compliance	<p><b>Needs improvement:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Project leads will need to communicate regularly with other departments (e.g., customer care centre, Roadways, Parks, Bylaw, etc.) to track Guideline compliance, review bylaw or resident complaints, and inform various staff about garden locations. Many processes related to tracking and monitoring are currently being updated during Fusion, so the exact mechanism through which these criteria will be tracked is currently unknown.</li> <li>A record of registered garden sites will be maintained and streamlined with an updated boulevard garden web page.</li> <li>Best practice research included a detailed review of 7 other municipalities with similar programs, and adoption of those best practices where feasible in Saskatoon.</li> </ul>	
Agility and Adaptiveness	<p><b>On track:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Guideline update has responded to recent public feedback about gaps and ambiguity in the current program.</li> </ul>	<p><b>Exceeding expectations:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Guideline update has responded to recent public feedback about gaps and ambiguity in the current program. The proposed program expansion is in response to significant public interest in gardening in rights-of-way.</li> </ul>

**For further/future consideration:**

- Through the expansion of the program, there are still some unknowns that will need to be monitored for continuous improvement. Project leads will need to communicate regularly with other departments (e.g., customer care centre, Roadways, Parks, Bylaw, etc.) and residents to track Guideline compliance, review bylaw or resident complaints, inform gardeners of upcoming road work when possible, and inform various staff about garden locations. Many processes related to tracking and monitoring are currently being updated during Fusion, so the exact mechanism through which these criteria will be tracked is currently unknown.