

Triple Bottom Line Implications – Energy Assistance Program Partnership with SaskPower

Process and Methodology

Administration used the City of Saskatoon's Triple Bottom Line (TBL) Decision Making Tool in order to comply with *Council Policy C08-001 - Triple Bottom Line*.

When conducting a TBL analysis, it is appropriate to compare and/or evaluate multiple options. However, given that this is a partnership opportunity with SaskPower on a fully developed program, only one option was reviewed.

In conducting the analysis, the Administration relied on the expertise of subject matter experts from the Sustainability Division as well as consultation with the SaskPower program coordinator. An Energy Assessment Program Brief provided by SaskPower was also consulted.

This review is meant as a high level assessment to identify the initiative's environmental, social, economic, and governance outcomes, as well as to identify opportunities to achieve even greater sustainability benefits. The results are meant to support ongoing decision making, rather than be relied upon as a fixed sustainability evaluation.

Caveats and Limitations:

- Some TBL areas were considered out of scope including items that were not contingent on and/or influenced by the initiative: Heritage, Arts, and Culture; Civic Participation; Recreation; Support for the Local Economy; Asset Management; Skills and Training.
- The following external factors impacted the initiative's ability to achieve higher TBL outcomes in certain areas:
 - Sustainable procurement – SaskPower will procure the vendor delivering the program, and their policies will be followed.
 - Monitoring Reporting, and Compliance – as a last-minute opportunity, not all best practises for project management, decision-making, and procurement are being followed.

Results & Findings

Overall, the results of Administration's TBL review indicate that:

- The initiative is Meeting Expectations for Environment, Social, and Financial principles, and is On Track for Good Governance.
- The initiative is Exceeding Expectations for four indicators: Conservation of Resources, Self Sufficiency and Living with Dignity, Financial Planning and Resourcing, and Affordability for Users.
- There are additional opportunities that could be explored to enhance the TBL outcomes of the initiative (see the "For Further / Future Consideration" sections later in this document).

A summary of results for each TBL principle and indicator are included in the subsequent section of this document. To provide context, a numerical description of the outcomes are shown in the following table:

TBL Score	TBL Outcome
Below 0%	Not Meeting Expectations
0-19%	Needs Improvement
20-39%	On-Track
40-59%	Meeting Expectations
60-79%	Exceeding Expectations
Above 80%	Leading the Way

Principle: Environmental Health and Integrity

TBL Outcome - by Principle:

Meeting Expectations – 40-59%

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

Indicator	Option
Renewable Energy	No Impact
Conservation of Resources	Exceeding expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The purpose of the program is to conserve energy and water. During the pilot program, approximately \$230 per year per household was saved.
Climate Change Mitigation and Adaptation	Meeting Expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Measured GHG reductions are expected through reduced consumption of water and energy. Reducing energy bills can increase resiliency, especially as energy costs continue to rise.
Green Buildings and Sustainable Land Use	No Impact
Sustainable Transportation	No Impact
Healthy Ecosystems	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Use of timers and encouraging lights being turned off may result in reduced outdoor light pollution.
Clean Air, Water, and Land	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conserving water can increase dependability of water supply.
Waste Reduction and Diversion	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The vendor delivering the program will be responsible for providing a plan showing that lightbulbs and thermostats containing mercury will be properly disposed of (during the pilot program, CFL lightbulbs were recycled).

Storm Water Management	No Impact
Sustainable Food System	No Impact

Principle: Social Equity and Cultural Wellbeing

TBL Outcome - by Principle:

Meeting Expectations – 40-59%

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

Indicator	Business As Usual
Equity and Opportunity	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Targeted at income qualified households that are not typically able to access SaskPower's energy efficient programs; targeting programs to lower income demographics may also improve accessibility for seniors, non-white (including Indigenous populations), and people with disabilities.
Diversity and Inclusion	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SaskPower will include mandatory criteria and weighting for Indigenous participation in procurement documents for contractor selection.
Heritage, Arts, and Culture	No Impact
Self Sufficiency and Living with Dignity	Exceeding Expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Program addresses energy poverty and improves housing affordability by lowering utility costs for lower income families.
Health and Wellbeing	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Improves quality of life by lowering utility bills.
Safety and Resiliency	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none"> SaskPower takes privacy very seriously. The program adheres to all SaskPower privacy policies and has been reviewed and approved by their Chief Privacy Officer.
Civic Participation	No Impact
Recreation	No Impact

For Further / Future Consideration

- Program could be expanded to include a safety assessment, for instance smoke detectors and/or extinguishers could be checked while contractors are already in the home.

Principle: Economic Benefits

TBL Outcome - by Principle:

Meeting Expectations – 40-59%

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

Indicator	Business As Usual
Innovation	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">Supports learning and encourages leadership and innovation through one-on-one coaching provided. Participants may choose to expand beyond small energy and water savings to larger, more impactful, improvements.
Sustainable Procurement	Needs improvement <ul style="list-style-type: none">While SaskPower includes criteria for Indigenous participation in their procurements, they do not include other sustainability criteria.
Financial Planning and Resourcing	Exceeding expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">Entering into a funding partnership with SaskPower promotes transparency and collaboration between the organizations, increases efficiencies, and hopefully paves the way for additional partnerships going forward.A grant for 25% of costs is also being accessed.
Affordability for Users	Exceeding expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">The program is free for income-qualified households, and provides them with a long-term cost saving benefit.
Support the Local Economy	No Impact
Asset Management	No Impact
Skills and Training	No Impact
Labour Rights and Employment	On Track <ul style="list-style-type: none">SaskPower will ensure contractor follows labour laws. While wages are not dictated by SaskPower, competitive rates were paid by the vendor during the pilot program.SaskPower is requiring that the program is managed from within Saskatchewan so an office will be set up in the province.

For Further / Future Consideration

- Include additional sustainability criteria through procurement.

Other Notes

- A detailed budget / financial analysis is included in the body of the report.

Principle: Good Governance

TBL Outcome - by Principle:

On Track - 20-39%

TBL Outcomes - by Indicator:

Indicator	Business As Usual
Ethical and Democratic Governance	On track <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The program aligns with City of Saskatoon (City) goals for equitable access to sustainability programs which are historically under-utilized by lower income households.• Non-profits representing target demographics were consulted through program design.• As a last-minute opportunity, typical decision-making and procurement procedures were not followed by the City. Instead, trust is being placed in the partner organization's processes. Lack of process and oversight provides some risk of real or perceived conflicts-of-interest or preferential treatment. Note, that no specific issues have been identified.
Effective Service Delivery	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">• A demonstrated program will be delivered to Saskatoon residents.
Education, Communication, Engagement, Capacity Building	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Public engagement was included during program design.• Communications, education, and capacity building are expected outcomes of the program.
Monitoring, Reporting and Compliance	Needs improvement <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Full project management practises have not been applied by the City to the project due to extremely short timelines. In addition, prioritization of this program over other planned initiatives, may negatively impact those initiatives.
Agility and Adaptiveness	Meeting expectations <ul style="list-style-type: none">• City staff at all levels, and colleagues at SaskPower, demonstrated adaptability and flexibility in order to capitalize on this opportunity while still following City policies and processes.
Roles, Responsibilities and Rewards	No Impact

For Further / Future Consideration

- During program delivery, start using project management best practises and continue following City policies and procedures.
- For future opportunities, allow more time for planning in order to better apply project management, decision-making, and procurement best practices.