

Governance Review – Other Agencies, Boards and Commissions Established by Council

ISSUE

The Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee (“Governance Subcommittee”) was directed to conduct a governance review of Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Business Improvement Districts (“BIDs”) and other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council. City Council has the authority to establish agencies, boards and commissions under both *The Cities Act* and other legislation. City Council’s role in respect of these bodies varies.

What agencies, boards and commissions apart from Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations and BIDs has City Council established and what role or relationship does City Council maintain with each? Which of these agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council warrant further review?

RECOMMENDATION

That the Governance and Priorities Committee recommend to City Council that:

1. The Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee review the following other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council:
 - a. Albert Community Centre Management Board;
 - b. Marr Residence Management Board;
 - c. Social Services Subcommittee;
 - d. Municipal Planning Commission; and
 - e. All of the Appeal Boards identified in this report and appendices.
2. The Leadership Team Governance Subcommittee report further on:
 - a. Recommended changes to the Terms of Reference, including mandates and composition of the other agencies, boards and committees; and
 - b. Bylaw and policy amendments required to implement any changes.

BACKGROUND

At the [February 13, 2017](#) meeting of the Governance and Priorities Committee (“GPC”), the Committee resolved:

“That the project parameters for the review of governance structures, models, practices and procedures of Advisory Committees, Controlled Corporations, Business Improvement Districts (“BID”) and any other agency, board or commission established by the City of Saskatoon be approved.”

Extensive reporting has already occurred for the Advisory Committees and Controlled Corporations, as well as initial reporting on the BIDs. That work remains ongoing.

This is the first report in a series of reports speaking to the other agencies, boards and commissions established by the City of Saskatoon.

DISCUSSION/ANALYSIS

City Council establishes bodies under its enabling legislation, *The Cities Act* (the “Act”) and as required or permitted under *The Planning and Development Act, 2007* (the “P&D Act”). These bodies are established to address various adjudicative or management functions.

Vacancies for all agencies, boards and commissions are advertised by the Office of the City Clerk, and the authority for appointments rests with City Council. Appointments are made as prescribed by the applicable legislation or bylaw and in accordance with Policy C01-003, *Appointments to Civic Boards, Commissions, Authorities and Committees*.

The Governance Subcommittee has identified 22 other agencies, boards or commissions established by City Council under the authority of the legislation (excluding the Advisory Committees and the Civic Naming Committee, which have already been the subject of a separate review). Appendix 1 provides a list of the other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council under the Act and the P&D Act.

Of the 22 agencies, boards and commissions identified, nine are appeal boards of some variety. While City Council establishes and appoints members to the appeal boards, a member of City Council does not sit on them. For many of the other agencies, boards and commissions, City Council’s participation is not mandatory but Council has chosen to sit. For convenience, this report groups the other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council into three categories based on these and other distinctions:

1. Appeal Boards;
2. Pension Boards and Committees; and
3. Management and Miscellaneous Agencies, Boards and Commissions.

Appendix 2 provides an overview of each of the 22 other agencies, boards and commissions established by City Council. Appendices 3 through 6 provide more details on the structure and function of each of these agencies, boards and commissions.

Given the number of these bodies and their varying functional roles, the Governance Subcommittee is recommending a governance review of a select group of them. The review will encompass the following:

- (a) Albert Community Centre Management Board;
- (b) Marr Residence Management Board;
- (c) Social Services Subcommittee;
- (d) Municipal Planning Commission; and
- (e) All of the Appeal Boards identified in this report and the appendices.

Several years have passed since most of the agencies, boards and commissions identified in the report have been the subject of a governance review. Subsequent reports to GPC will provide policy options and recommendations that aim to improve, modernize and reform the structure and function of these agencies, boards and commissions.

It is recommended that each of the bodies established under sections 55 and 329 of the Act be reviewed with the exception of the Municipal Review Commission, which is a relatively new commission. Consideration would be given to whether the continued existence of the agency, board or commission is warranted, whether the Terms of Reference continue to be relevant and whether changes to the composition, term of appointment and other similar criteria are necessary. This would include the City Mortgage Appeals Board and the Access Transit Appeals Board. Consideration as to whether there is merit in amalgamating the local appeal boards established under section 329 will be considered given the commonality of membership amongst them.

Similarly, the proposed review will include a review of all of the other Appeal Boards including the Saskatoon License Appeals Board, the Development Appeals Board and the Board of Revision.

Given the complexity of tax assessment and the responsibility for large commercial assessment appeals worth significant dollars, ensuring the appropriate resources and compensation are reflective of the nature of the role of the Board of Revision members is imperative. For this reason, it is anticipated that the Board of Revision will be the first of the other agencies, boards and commissions reviewed. Historically, it has been difficult to recruit members for Board of Revision vacancies. Given its mandate, members appointed to the Board of Revision are required to have specific skills. Records indicate that the compensation currently being offered was set approximately 10 years ago without further consideration. The governance review will consider whether current resources and compensation are reflective of the skills and responsibilities of Board of Revision members or whether these are a barrier to the recruitment of a diverse and qualified pool of candidates.

The Pension Boards and Committees will not be reviewed. The existence of these Boards and Committees has been negotiated with the bargaining units. A governance review as part of the work of the Governance Subcommittee is not appropriate given the dynamics of this relationship. A different approach would be required if City Council wishes to review these bodies. However, no issues have been brought forward to the City Clerk's Office or the Governance Subcommittee at this time. Further, the Police Pension Boards are beyond the scope of the governance review as they are the responsibility of the Board of Police Commissioners. They are identified, however, as members of City Council have been appointed to sit on them.

Likewise, neither the Municipal Review Commission nor the Corman Park - Saskatoon District Planning Commission will be reviewed. The Municipal Review Commission is a relatively new body and has already been the subject of several reports with respect to

report schedule and other issues. While a further review is not being recommended at this time, the body will continue to be reviewed periodically.

Given the ongoing P4G project and the significant work underway in this area, review is also not being recommended for the Corman Park - Saskatoon District Planning Commission.

OTHER IMPLICATIONS

There are no financial, privacy, legal, social or environmental implications identified.

NEXT STEPS

This report will be shared with the agencies, boards and commissions identified in this report being recommended for review. They will be notified that the report is to be debated at the April meeting of GPC. Any future changes will be communicated through the City Clerk's Office.

In the meantime, the Governance Subcommittee will conduct a review of similar bodies in other jurisdictions and, where appropriate, engage with the Chair and/or members of the agencies, boards and commissions identified in this report to gain practical insight into how they operate and what, if any, reforms can be made to improve their structure and function.

APPENDICES

1. List of Other Agencies, Boards & Commissions Established by City Council
2. Overview of Other Agencies, Boards and Commissions Established by City Council
3. Table – Appeal Boards
4. Table – Pensions Boards and Committees
5. Table – Management and Miscellaneous Agencies, Boards & Commissions Recommended for Further Governance Review
6. Table – Management and Miscellaneous Agencies, Boards & Commissions Not Recommended for Review

Report Approval

Written by: Christine G. Bogad, Director of Legal Services
Shellie Bryant, Deputy City Clerk
Candice Leuschen, Executive Assistant to the City Solicitor

Reviewed by: Joanne Sproule, City Clerk
Mike Jordan, Chief Public Policy and Government Relations Officer
Lynne Lacroix, A/City Manager

Approved by: Cindy Yelland, City Solicitor